

National Transportation Safety Board

Office of Aviation Safety

Washington, DC 20594



ERA23FA113

ON-SCENE EXAMINATION SUMMARY

January 27, 2025

A. TABLE OF CONTENTS

A. ACCIDENT	3
B. ON-SCENE EXAMINATION SUMMARY	3
C. SUMMARY	3
1.0. DETAILS OF THE INVESTIGATION	5
1.1 On-scene Investigation Details	5
1.2 Pilot and Co-Pilot Seat Examinations	8
1.3 Additional Information	8
2.0. PARTS RETENTION	9
2.1 Insight G3 With SD Card - PN 610C-001 SN 1107	9
2.2 Upper Garmin G5 - PN 011-03809-00 SN 4JQ043929	9
2.3 Lower Garmin G5 - PN 011-03809-00 SN 4JQ044045	9
2.4 Stratus AHRS - PN 153510-000113	9
2.5 Samsung Cellular Phone- Chafetz	9
2.6 Blue Apple iPhone 12 - Taub	9
2.7 Apple iPad Mini - Taub	9

A. ACCIDENT

Location: North Castle, New York
Date: January 19, 2023
Time: 1729 EST
2229 coordinated universal time (UTC)
Airplane: N19MT, Beech A36

B. ON-SCENE EXAMINATION SUMMARY

IIC	Timothy W. Monville NTSB-OAS/ERA Washington, DC
Member	John R. Harris FAA Flight Standards District Office Farmingdale, New York
Member	Casey Love Textron Aviation Wichita, Kansas

C. SUMMARY

On January 19, 2023, about 1729 EST, a Beech A36, N19MT, was substantially damaged when it was involved in an accident near North Castle, New York. The private pilot and one passenger were fatally injured. The airplane was operated as a Title 14 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 91 personal flight.

According to the sole stockholder of the airplane (stockholder), the pilot and passenger had flown earlier that day from Cuyahoga County Airport (CGF), Cleveland, Ohio to John F Kennedy International Airport (JFK), New York, New York.

The purpose of the accident flight was to return to CGF.

After takeoff from JFK the pilot twice reported to Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) air traffic control that the airplane was experiencing poor climb performance. The controller advised the pilot that the flight could proceed to Westchester County Airport (HPN), White Plains, New York to have the issue checked out and he agreed. The flight was vectored to HPN for the instrument landing system (ILS) runway 16 approach which was in-use.

During a controlled descent, the airplane crashed on water supply land, owned by the City of New York and managed by the New York City Department of Environmental Protection.

Examination of the wreckage at the accident site revealed fresh oil on the bottom of the fuselage (Figures 1 and 2). The oil was predominantly on the left side of the lower fuselage and appeared to be coming from behind the left cowl flap area. Because of the final resting position of the fuselage the oil was draining down towards the ground. Oil was also noted on the inside diameter and outlet of the lower crankcase breather line (Figure 3).



Figure 1 View of the Bottom of the Fuselage. Note the Fresh Oil Clinging to the Bottom Fuselage Skin



Figure 2 View of the Bottom Portion of the Fuselage Near the Tailcone. Note the Fresh Oil Clinging to the Bottom Fuselage Skin



Figure 3 View of the Outlet of the Lower Crankcase Breather Line. Oil on Finger was from the Inner Surface Immediately Adjacent to the Opening. Note the Fresh Oil.

Examination of the engine at the accident site revealed it was separated and came to rest inverted. After rolling onto its right side a hole was noted in the engine crankcase above the No. 6 cylinder position (Figure 4). The connecting

rod cap with 2 entrapped fractured connecting rod bolts was found inside the engine below the hole opening. The cap was deformed.



**Figure 4: View Depicting the Engine After Rolling Out of its Impact Resting Spot
Note the hole in the Crankcase at the No. 6 Cylinder Position.**

1.0. DETAILS OF THE INVESTIGATION

1.1 On-scene Investigation Details

Examination of the accident site area revealed the airplane first impacted a tree about 100 ft above ground level (agl) at 41.082849° north latitude and -73.728200° west longitude. Multiple tree contacts at slightly generally decreasing heights were noted along the energy path between the 1st impacted tree and the resting position of the main wreckage located 250 ft later; the energy path was oriented on magnetic heading of 179°.

The main wreckage consisting of the fuselage with attached aft empennage came to rest wedged near the base of two trees located at 41.082124° north latitude and -73.727880° west longitude, at an elevation of 444 ft. The fuselage was heading 190° and was slightly above ground level in a 90° left roll attitude with both wings and the engine separated. The engine without propeller was located about 33 ft forward of the main wreckage; the propeller came to rest in close proximity to the engine and fuselage. Both

vertical and horizontal stabilizers and the primary and secondary flight control surfaces remained attached. The right horizontal stabilizer was extensively impact damaged and displaced aft. The right elevator was displaced aft from the stabilizer but remained connected at the hinge points. The left elevator trim tab actuator was not measured; however, with the elevator in a near neutral position, the elevator trim tab appeared to be slight tab trailing edge down. The right elevator trim tab was tab trailing edge up and the trim tab actuator was extended 2.0 inches, which calculated to be beyond limits in the tab trailing edge down direction. Elevator and rudder flight control cable continuity was confirmed from the cockpit attach points to each control surface. The landing gear drive depicted the landing gear in the retracted position. Examination of the airframe fuel strainer (which was inverted) revealed it smelled like 100 low lead fuel; the screen had slight external contamination.

Further examination of the energy path revealed a second set of impacted trees about 60 ft agl was located about 60 ft from the first impacted tree, while a third set of impacted trees about 60 ft agl was located about 200 ft from the first impacted tree. The main wreckage came to rest 50 ft from the third set of impacted trees. An impact mark in one tree adjacent to the main wreckage was located about 30 ft agl. Pieces of the wreckage which were elevated in the trees were removed which revealed the 1st piece of separated wreckage consisted of the outboard half of the right tip tank, while the 2nd piece of separated wreckage consisted of the inboard half of the right tip tank with attached 2 foot section of wing leading edge.

Cockpit Readings:

Fuel Selector Valve - Left Tank Position

Throttle - 1/4 inch from full forward. Handle moves freely due to separated engine

Mixture Control - Full rich

Propeller Control - Full Forward

Flap Selector and Indicator - Up

Landing Gear Selector - Up

Battery - Intermediate position. Switch free to move

Magneto Switch - Both

Pitot Heat - Free to move

Fuel Pump - On

Panel Light Switch - Missing

Avionics Master Switch - Broke

Cowl Flap Handle - Open

Insight G3 - Remained installed in Instrument panel with SD card in place. PN 610C-001 SN 1107. SD Card and Instrument Retained

COCKPIT READINGS CONTINUED -

Samsung Cellular Phone - Retained
Cellular Phone - Retained
Mini iPad - Retained
Upper Garmin G5 - PN 011-03809-00 SN 4JQ043929. Retained
Lower Garmin G5 - PN 011-03809-00 SN 4JQ044045. Retained
Stratus AHRS - PN 153510-000113. Retained.
Airspeed - 0
Turn Coordinator - Wings Level, ball width to the right.
ADF - Compass card 090. Bearing 330° to the Station
Altimeter - Remained attached to the panel. 29.84 inches of Mercury and 820 ft.
Vertical Speed Indicator - +1,000 FPM
Attitude Indicator - Separated From Panel. Impact damage noted. 90° Right Wing Low and 20° Nose Low.
Turn and Slip Indicator - Separated from Instrument Panel. Glass cracked.
Needle Full Right, ball moves freely.
Cylinder Temperature - Off scale low
Oil Temperature - Off scale low
Ammeter - 0
Oil Pressure - 0
Tachometer - Separated from panel. 0 Rpm. 1889.21
Manifold Pressure - Needle Missing. Combi gauge separated from panel
Fuel Flow - Needle Missing. Combi gauge separated from panel
Elevator Trim Indicator - 11 Units¹

Examination of the left wing revealed the 4 ft inboard portion of it remained structurally attached to the fuselage with a 26-inch section of flap remained attached to the inboard hinge. The wing was fractured at the wing/flap junction. The remaining section of flap remained attached to the outboard hinge, while the full span of the aileron remained attached. The flap actuator was extended about 1.7 inches consistent with flaps retracted. A semi-circular indentation in the leading edge of the wing was noted about 6 ft inboard from the wingtip attach rib. The landing gear was outside of the wheel well. The tip tank was separated with a portion of it found next to the engine. The pitot tube was not observed. The stall warning horn was separated from the wing but remained electrically connected; the vane moved freely. The aileron push/pull rod was fractured (overload) near the control surface. Both aileron control cables had sections of fractured aileron bellcrank attached (overload).

¹ Airplane nose up or airplane nose down could not be determined. The trim tab indicator gears and mount were impact damaged.

Examination of the right wing revealed an approximate 7 ft long section (inboard section) was structurally separated but found in the immediate vicinity of the fuselage. The full span of the flap remained attached, and the landing gear was in the wheel well. The flap actuator was extended about 1.7 inches consistent with flaps retracted. An approximate 2 ft diameter semi-circular indentation in the leading edge of the wing was noted at the wing root. The fuel cap was in-place, and the fuel bladder was torn. The aileron direct cable remained connected to the overload fractured bellcrank near the control surface. The balance cable was fractured consistent with tension overload. The aileron pushrod near the control surface exhibited overload fracture. The aileron was fractured in 2 pieces but remained attached to the outboard hinge; the full span of the aileron was accounted for. The outboard portion of the tip tank marked "A" was located at 041.082708° north latitude and -73.728105° west longitude. The outboard section of the wing spanning about 3 ft marked "B" was located at 041.082783° north latitude and -73.728159. About 20 ft from that location was in impacted tree with separated tree limb; the diameter of the separated limb was about 10 inches. The tip tank with attached approximate 2 ft long section of leading-edge skin marked "C" was located at 41.082612° north latitude and -73.728099° west longitude.

1.2 Pilot and Co-Pilot Seat Examinations

Examination of the pilot's seat which was separated from the cockpit revealed the outboard seat track was separated from the seat feet, while the inboard seat track remained attached to the feet. The forward seat feet were splayed outboard. The lapbelt webbing was cut consistent recovery.

Examination of the co-pilot's seat which was separated from the cockpit revealed the seat base was displaced down and rotated to the right. The inboard and outboard seat tracks remained attached to the seat feet. The forward seat feet were splayed outboard. The lapbelt was buckled but the outboard webbing was cut.

1.3 Additional Information

Luggage inside the airplane was inspected and photographed by NTSB. During the inspection a loaded Sig Sauer 365 9 MM subcompact gun SN 66A475316 with 2 clips of ammunition were found in a gun case found within a zippered bag. The gun and clips were turned over to New York City Department of Environmental Protection Police. A pilot logbook was recovered and photographed by NTSB and Textron Aviation and returned to the personal effects bag. Additionally, a prescription bottle for Tramadol 50MG in the name of another person was found in the pilot's luggage.

2.0. PARTS RETENTION

- 2.1 Insight G3 With SD Card - PN 610C-001 SN 1107.
- 2.2 Upper Garmin G5 - PN 011-03809-00 SN 4JQ043929.
- 2.3 Lower Garmin G5 - PN 011-03809-00 SN 4JQ044045.
- 2.4 Stratus AHRS - PN 153510-000113
- 2.5 Samsung Cellular Phone- Chafetz
- 2.6 Blue Apple iPhone 12 - Taub
- 2.7 Apple iPad Mini - Taub

Submitted by:

Timothy W. Monville
Sr. Air Safety Investigator