



U.S. Department
of Transportation
**Federal Aviation
Administration**

Juan C Garcia
Aviation Safety Inspector

South Florida Flight Standards District Office 19
[REDACTED]
Miramar, FL 33027

Juan C. Garcia IIC-Inspectors Statement – Accident Investigation

NTSB # ERA16LA103

ATQA No.: [REDACTED]

Registration: N8466G

PTRS: [REDACTED]

Make: Piper

Model: PA-28-161

Serial Number: 28-8216064

Aircraft/Engine Last Annual: 07/03/2015 @ TT 19383.6/Hobbs 490.2

Aircraft/Engine/Propeller Last 100Hr: 10/29/15 @ TT 19483.1/Hobbs 589.7

****Note** propeller removed on 04/10/15 and replaced on 05/14/2015 before annual inspection was due.**

When: February 2, 2016

Where: Aircraft N8446G had a planned VFR cross county flight with 2 private pilots on board that departed Fort Lauderdale Executive (FXE) airport to Florida Keys Marathon (MTH) airport and back to FXE. The flight returning from MTH to FXE aircraft N8446G performed an emergency crash landing in the ocean off the shoreline of Haulover Park Beach Inlet, Miami Beach Florida approximately 100 feet of the beach 25° 54' 03.11 N, 08° 07' 15.59 W.

What: Part 141 Operation, operated Piper PA-28-161, N8466G was owned by Growl Inc., located in Merritt Inland, Florida and operated by Avborne Career Academy located at Fort Lauderdale Executive Airport, Fort Lauderdale, Florida.

Who: Pilot(Pilot In Command):

Juan Jose Ortiz Carrera (US VISA No.: [REDACTED] / Passport No.: [REDACTED])

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED] Ecuador

Temporary Airman Certificate Issues 01/25/16

Medical Certificate second Class: Date of Examination 07/31/2015

Pilot (Second In Command):

Favian Ignacio Bobadilla Ruiz

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED] Chile.

Temporary Airman Certificate Issues 01/19/16

Medical Certificate second Class: Date of Examination 10/14/2015

Juan Jose Ortiz Carrera/ Favian Ignacio Bobadilla Ruiz

Written Statement day of accident 02/02/16.

I just started doing hour building one week ago. Today we decided to go to Marathon because the weather up in the north was IFR in the morning. The school Airborne Carrier Academy owns the 8466G is a Piper Warrior PA-28-161. When we did the run up at KFXE Fort Lauderdale Executive, we noticed the right magneto drop a little more than usual. Then we lean the mixture and let the engine run for a minute, then we check it again and it worked fine. We did a full stop landing at Marathon and we were coming back to KFXE. When we were over the shore line, approach told us to go to or below 500 feet. Then when we came back at a straight and level flight the throttle didn't work, we put full power and the RPM going like it supposed to. Then we did the emergency engine failure procedures and we land over the ocean. We were able to get outside of the aircraft and swim to the beach with the help of the life guard.

Examination of the aircraft and crash site:

Aircraft landed 100 feet of the shoreline in the ocean, the aircraft could be seen submerged under water in about 15-20 feet of saltwater with the only a small section of the vertical stabilizer popping out the water. Aircraft was secured and towed to a boat ramp to be recovered. Aircraft landing gear broke off on impact with the ocean and floated on the surface where it was recovered. Aircraft sustained major damage during impact with ocean and during recovery since aircraft was towed partially submerged and full of saltwater. Both left and right wing tanks were contaminated with salt water, and unable to determine the total amount of fuel left in both tanks before landing in the ocean. Aircraft was cut into transportable sections and taken by Florida Air Recovery for storage and further examination by FAA and NTSB.

On February 10, 2016, Mr. Dan Boggs the NTSB investigator examined the engine. The right magneto was found timed with the engine and within limits, the left magneto was not but after further inspection of the magnetos, both were extremely contaminated with sand, saltwater and corrosion developing due to being submerged in saltwater. The magnetos were disassembled and found the magnetos to be mechanically sound. Examination of the engine found all four the cylinders still produced suction and compression and the internal mechanism was found to be mechanically sound with no other issues or discrepancy found with the engine.

The cockpit configuration found the fuel lever in the right tank position, throttle in full throttle position indicating maximum thrust required from the engine and fuel mixture in rich position maximum fuel required. The ignition switch was in the both position; fuel boost pump switch in the on position and the carb heat lever pulled into the down position indicating carb heat on.

Interview with Pilot Juan Jose Ortiz Carrera and Favian Ignacio Bobadilla Ruiz on 02/12/16:

Mr. Juan Jose Ortiz Carrera stated he and Mr. Favian Ignacio Bobadilla Ruiz plan to do a cross country to Marathon airport and back to Fort Lauderdale Executive airport since there was VFR weather on the southern part of Florida. Mr. Carrera stated the aircraft had 48

gallons of fuel before he and Mr. Ruiz took off to Marathon airport. Mr. Carrera stated he and Mr. Ruiz checked the wing tanks and checked the fuel strainer for water contamination. The fuel was clear of any type of water or contamination. Mr. Carrera stated he sat in the right cockpit seat and was acting as second in command (SIC) to assist Mr. Ruiz who was flying the first leg of the cross country to Marathon Airport. Mr. Carrera stated when they did the run up at Fort Lauderdale Executive; they noticed the right magneto drop a little more than usual. Then they lean the mixture and let the engine run for a minute, then we check it again and it worked fine. Mr. Carrera stated he would advise Mr. Ruiz to switch the fuel selector for the left and right wing fuel tanks every 30 minute per the cockpit time instrument on the cockpit panel. Mr. Ruiz stated Mr. Carrera would advise him when to change the fuel selector and that is was every 30 minutes they would switch the fuel tank selector.

Mr. Carrera stated the flight from Fort Lauderdale Executive airport to the Marathon Airport took about 1 hour and 20 minutes. Mr. Carrera stated they flew both legs of the cross country with the mixture more rich than lean. They made a full stop landing to use the restroom at the Marathon Airport. Mr. Carrera stated during the preflight at the Marathon Airport he checked the fuel in both the left and right wing tanks and the fuel indicated around 17 gallons in each wing tank giving then a total of 34 gallons. Mr. Ruiz stated the fuel indicator stick indicated the fuel amount was just over the 17 gallon engraved reference mark. Mr. Carrera stated the fuel indicator stick that he used to check the fuel has an engraved marking indicating 17 gallons of fuel as a reference. This engraved marking provides pilot and estimate of how much fuel are in the wing tanks above the mark is more than 17 gallon below mark less than 17 gallons.

Mr. Carrera stated on the flight back to Fort Lauderdale Executive airport he sat in the left seat making him the PIC and Mr. Ruiz the SIC. They also had no issues with the magnetos when they did their run up at Marathon Airport. Mr. Carrera stated they departed Marathon airport contacted Miami Center which vectored them over the coast. Mr. Carrera stated Miami Center then instructed to descend to 2000 feet then to 500 feet and to look out for traffic. Mr. Carrera stated during the decent he pulled the throttle back and put the carb heat selector to the on position and when he got to 500 feet the leveled off and added power the engine and RPM did not respond. Mr. Carrera stated the engine propeller was still turning but there was no vibration or popping sounds coming from the engine. He said he pulling the throttle down and up to see if it was stuck but the engine did not respond and there was no movement of the RPM gauge, he switch the tanks to see if it was a fuel issue but still no response from the engine. Mr. Carrera preformed emergency landing procedures deciding to land on the water so they would not hurt anyone on the beach.

Mr. Carrera did the emergency engine failure procedures and they land over the ocean off the shoreline of Haulover Park Beach Inlet, Miami Beach Florida approximately 100 feet of the beach. Mr. Carrera and Mr. Ruiz were able to get outside of the aircraft and swim to the beach with the help of the life guard.

Juan C Garcia
Aviation Safety Inspector