

Inspector's Statement

N613PJ Accident, July 22, 2015, PBI

On July 22, a ground collision occurred at the West Palm Beach (PBI) Airport between N613PJ, a CL-601-3AER (CL600-2B16) S/N 5123, and a Kubota ATV. The collision occurred on the ramp of Atlantic Aviation at approximately 1410 local time. The aircraft was moving under its own power, and ran over the ATV, which was parked about ten feet in front of the left wing. The collision resulted in the ATV being tumbled one and three quarter times, during which the leading edge and underside of the left wing was punctured. The puncture resulted in a fuel spill estimated to be about 300 gallons of Jet-A. There was additional damage to at least three of the L wing flap hinges or fairings and the L MLG door, in addition to several scrapes and rubs at various points under the L wing and flap. There were no injuries to either of the two line crew present or the aircraft crew, and no fire resulted. There were no other persons on board.

A representative of the aircraft operator, Paragon Jets of Teterboro, NJ, Peter Kotlinski, who indicated in a phone conversation that he was the Office Manager, stated the flight was dispatched under Part 135, to reposition to Miami Opa Locka Airport (OPF) for a passenger pickup, and then was to proceed to Washington Dulles Airport (IAD).

The first witnesses to the accident available for interview were three linemen, all employees of Atlantic Aviation, the FBO where N613PJ was parked. Mr. Robinson Duvelsaint was near the FBO building, which was about three hundred feet behind and to the left of, the aircraft. He heard the engines being started and noted no line crew nearby, and saw the aft baggage compartment door was fully opened. He brought this to the attention of his Shift Supervisor, Mr. Jason Garbett. Mr. Garbett asked a newly hired Line Service Technician, Mr. Michael Maresca, to accompany him to the aircraft. They drove to the aircraft on a Kubota ATV used by Atlantic to transport baggage and supplies around the ramp. He asked Mr. Maresca to marshal the aircraft out of parking, and Mr. Maresca walked to the front of the aircraft.

In his statement to me, Mr. Garbett said he parked the ATV about ten feet in front of the left wing of the aircraft, adjacent to the pilot. He motioned to the crew to gain their attention, and signaled that the rear door was open. He noted the male pilot occupying the right seat got up and went to the back of the aircraft to close the door. Shortly after, the plane began moving forward. Mr. Garbett attempted to gain the attention of the female pilot in the left seat, but stated she was looking down, not outside. The aircraft struck the ATV while moving at a speed about that of a normally taxiing aircraft, rolling the ATV one and three-quarter times under the left wing. At that point, he stated the pilot looked up, realized she had struck an object, and brought the aircraft to a sudden stop. Fuel was gushing from the underside of the left wing. The engines and APU were quickly shut down, and the front door was opened by the male pilot, who hurried down the stairs and began yelling angrily about the parking of the ATV to both line technicians. Mr. Garbett radioed the FBO, asking that the Fire Department be called for a fuel spill.

Mr. Maresca, in his statement to me, indicated he had worked for Atlantic for three weeks, and was in training to become a Line Service Technician. His Supervisor, Mr. Garbett, asked him to accompany him to N613PJ, to gain experience under supervision in the marshalling of aircraft on

Inspector's Statement

N613PJ Accident, July 22, 2015, PBI

the ramp. On the way to the aircraft, he also noted the Aft Bag Door open, and that the chocks had been removed by the crew. The engines were being started when they arrived, and he waived his marshalling wands at the pilots in the cockpit, and when he had their attention, pointed to the rear and gave a door open signal. He stated the male pilot in the right seat got up and left the cockpit, leaving the female pilot in the left seat. Before the male pilot returned to the cockpit, the aircraft began rolling, but the female pilot did not notice the movement, and remained looking down. After the aircraft struck the ATV, she looked up and stopped the movement, but by then the aircraft had passed over the ATV and was stopped about ten feet in front of the ATV, which was now laying on its side on the ramp. He noticed fuel pouring from the underside of the left wing, and signaled the pilot to shut down the engines.

The Pilot in Command of the flight was Captain Timothy V. Ewell, holder of ATP Certificate [REDACTED] and a Type Rating in the CL-600 and CL-604 variants. He was in possession of his Pilot Certificate and a First Class Medical Certificate issued on 3/17/2015. He was sixty-eight years old, and held a restriction that he needed glasses for near vision, which he produced. Captain Ewell stated he had worked for Paragon Jets for about three months, and had about 4,400 hours of experience in the Challenger Series of aircraft.

The Second in Command was Ms. Andrea Dworshak, holder of Commercial Pilot Certificate [REDACTED] with Second in Command type rating in the CL-600 Series aircraft. She was in possession of an unrestricted First Class Medical Certificate. She was 40 years old, and stated she had less than 80 hours in type, and had just completed training in May of 2015. Ms. Dworshak stated she joined Paragon Jets about three months ago.

Ms. Dworshak, who was interviewed by me first, stated she had been offered the left seat by Capt. Ewell, as there were no passengers on board, and he thought the experience would help her become more familiar with the characteristics of the CL-60. She stated she had flown from the left seat during a portion of her training, but that this was the first time in the left seat of the aircraft. She stated they had been in a hotel nearby for the previous five days, after diverting into PBI for maintenance. Their original destination was OPF, but an indication of an engine bleed air leak caused the Captain to contact their company, which diverted them. She stated that she was well-rested at the time they were notified of the flight, around 11:00 AM that morning. They proceeded to the airport, arriving around 13:00, and she entered the aircraft and prepared the aircraft for flight while the Captain conducted the exterior pre-flight inspection, supervised the fueling, filed flight plans, and obtained weather reports. She further stated they were expecting to be joined by a Cabin Service Attendant, and left the Baggage door open so she could put her bag into the bag compartment from outside the aircraft. The Captain boarded around 14:00 and advised her the company had just told him the Cabin Attendant would be joining them at OPF. Engine start was commenced around 14:05, and after completing the start of both engines, they both simultaneously noticed the Line Technician in front of the aircraft waiving his wands and pointing to the left side, where they saw the Line Supervisor signaling that a door was open at the rear of the aircraft. She stated Capt. Ewell said he would get up and close the door, and for her to hold the brakes. She stated she looked down to perform a scan of instruments, that Capt. Ewell returned to the cockpit, sat down in the seat, and it was then she felt a bump and looked out to see the aircraft was rolling forward. She stated both she and Capt.

Inspector's Statement

N613PJ Accident, July 22, 2015, PBI

Ewell applied the brakes, but that the pedals had no pressure when they pushed on them. She said the parking brake was set, so she released and reapplied it, which stopped the movement suddenly.

Capt. Ewell was interviewed last. He basically re-stated what his SIC told me, and when specifically asked where he was at the moment the aircraft hit the ATV, he stated he was in the right seat, did not perceive aircraft movement prior to impact, but felt the aircraft hit the ATV, and attempted to apply brakes. He stated braking was not effective until the SIC released the parking Brake and re-applied it, at which time the aircraft stopped. He said he shut the engines down by moving both thrust levers to the cutoff position and secured the APU and turned off the Battery Switch, got up, opened the door and went outside to inspect the damage.

On Thursday, July 30, 2015, I met with Mr. Steve Jones, the Director of Maintenance for Paragon Jets at their contracted maintenance facility at PBI. He had coordinated interim repairs to the wing that would permit a small amount of fuel sufficient to support engine and APU operation for a short period of time. I observed him and a Technician from the contracted maintenance facility power up the aircraft per the Manufacturer's Checklist. All (3) hydraulic systems showed normal indications of pressure and fluid quantity, and all electric pumps functioned normally. The parking brake was set and normal system pressure was indicated. Both engines were started, and the electric pumps were turned off. Both engine driven hydraulic pumps developed normal system pressure, and both inboard and outboard brakes showed normal pressure. The parking brake was released, and the aircraft allowed to roll for two inches before brakes were reapplied. The aircraft stopped immediately. The parking brake was reapplied, and engines were shut down. No abnormalities of any kind were noted. Mr. Jones stated the brakes felt normal to him. I was provided a copy of the Scope of Work performed by the contract facility prior to the mishap. Nothing was done to, nor would have affected, the hydraulic or brake systems of the aircraft. However, the lengths of the four brake disc measuring pins were taken, and all measurements were within acceptable range for dispatch.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Inspector's Statement



Submitted 8/4/2015, by

Larry E. Hazel, Principal Operations Inspector
FAA FSDO SO-19
Miramar, FL