

DCA24LA318

OPERATIONAL FACTORS/HUMAN PERFORMANCE

Attachment 1

Crew Interviews and Written Statements

November 4, 2024

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTERVIEW OF: BRADLEY BACHAND, CAPTAIN	3
CAPTAINS WRITTEN STATEMENT	53
INTERVIEW OF: ALEXANDRE J. BEAUMONT, FIRST OFFICER.....	56
FIRST OFFICERS WRITTEN STATEMENT	102

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

Investigation of: *

*

WRONG RUNWAY LANDING AT THE
CHICAGO O'HARE INTERNATIONAL
AIRPORT IN CHICAGO, ILLINOIS *
ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2024 *

*

* Accident No.: DCA24LA318

*

Interview of: BRADLEY BACHAND, Captain

Envoy Airlines

via Microsoft Teams

Tuesday,
October 8, 2024

APPEARANCES:

STARR BLUM, Operational Factors Investigator
National Transportation Safety Board

DR. KATHERINE WILSON, Human Performance Investigator
National Transportation Safety Board

TIMOTHY GRAHAM, Check Airman
Envoy Airlines

GERARD SMITHERS, Aircrew Program Designee (APD)
Envoy Airlines
Air Line Pilots Association (ALPA) Representative

MATTHEW HUNTSMAN
Representative for Captain Bachand

I N D E X

<u>ITEM</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
Interview of Bradley Bachand:	
By Ms. Blum	8
By Dr. Wilson	30
By Mr. Graham	35
By Mr. Smithers	42
By Dr. Wilson	45
By Ms. Blum	50

INTERVIEW

(3:13 p.m. CST)

MS. BLUM: Okay. It is October 8th, 2024, and the time is 3:13 Central Standard Time.

My name is Starr Blum, and I'm an operational factors investigator for the NTSB, and with me is Dr. Kat Wilson who's a human performance investigator, and we're going to be leading the group for this investigation for Incident Number DCA24LA318 involving Envoy Flight 3936.

The NTSB is an independent federal agency. We're not part of the Department of Transportation or the FAA. We have no regulatory or enforcement powers. Our mission is to determine the probable cause of incidents and accidents and make recommendations so similar things don't happen again.

Our mission does not include findings of liability or blame. And, your participation today just helps us ensure that the fact finding phase of this investigation is complete and accurate.

We will be recording this interview so that it can be transcribed. After we receive the transcript, our group will review it and make any corrections like acronyms or spelling, and if you'd like the opportunity to review the transcript, you can as well, too.

CAPT BACHAND: Okay.

MS. BLUM: Just put a request for me. So let's go ahead and have everybody introduce themselves. Kat.

DR. WILSON: Katherine Wilson. I'm a human performance investigation with the NTSB.

MS. BLUM: Tim.

1 MR. GRAHAM: Tim Graham, Chicago based line check airman, been with
2 Envoy 7 years, all on the 175, around 3800 hours on it, prior to that, retired military.

3 MS. BLUM: Good.

4 MR. SMITHERS: Gerard Smithers, APD, 175, been with the company now
5 24 years. Long time.

6 MS. BLUM: And that's the reason we have these guys is their technical
7 expertise.

8 CAPT BACHAND: Sure. Absolutely.

9 MS. BLUM: I have a flying background, but I have not flown the Embraer.
10 So these guys are here to help me.

11 CAPT BACHAND: Okay. Absolutely.

12 MS. BLUM: So please answer all the questions just to the best of your
13 recollection. There's no right or wrong answers. We're trying again, to get an
14 education from your point of view and understand what led up to the incident.

15 CAPT BACHAND: Sure.

16 MS. BLUM: And if you don't understand a question, just say so. We can
17 restate it, and if you don't know, that's a perfectly fine answer. And again, if you need
18 to take a break at any time, just please let us know.

19 You're entitled to have a representative of your choosing present during
20 this interview. Is there someone you'd like to have as your representative?

21 CAPT BACHAND: Yes.

22 MS. BLUM: Thank you. Can you please spell and state your name.

23 MR. HUNTSMAN: Sure. My name is Matthew Huntsman. It's spelled M-a-
24 t-t-h-e-w, last name, H-u-n-t-s-m-a-n.

25 MS. BLUM: Thank you. Please refrain from answering any questions. May

1 I call you Brad?

2 CAPT BACHAND: Yes, please.

3 MS. BLUM: On Brad's behalf. You can direct him not to answer questions
4 or request a short break to confer if needed. Sound good? Does anybody have any
5 questions?

6 (No response.)

7 INTERVIEW OF BRADLEY BACHAND

8 BY MS. BLUM:

9 Q. Okay. Let's begin. Let's start with the hard stuff. Can you please state
10 and spell your name?

11 A. Sure. It's -- first name, too, you want spelled. Bradley Bachand, B-r-a-d-l-
12 e-y, last name is Bachand, B-a-c-h-a-n-d.

13 Q. Thank you. How old are you?

14 A. 54.

15 Q. And your employer?

16 A. Envoy Airlines.

17 Q. What's your job title?

18 A. Pilot. You want pilot or captain.

19 Q. Captain.

20 A. Captain. Good.

21 Q. And where is your base?

22 A. Chicago.

23 Q. Have you held any managerial or training roles here at Envoy?

24 A. No.

25 Q. So ballpark, if you don't know, what would you say your total time is, flight

- 1 time?
- 2 A. 7,000, 7100 maybe.
- 3 Q. Okay. How about your time in (indiscernible)?
- 4 A. Maybe 400.
- 5 Q. Okay. And is all of that 400 in captain time?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. How much PIC time do you have in the 175?
- 8 A. Maybe 350.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. And it's approximate. I'm not positive.
- 11 Q. Ballpark's fine. What class medical certificate do you have?
- 12 A. First class.
- 13 Q. Any limitations on it?
- 14 A. It might be (indiscernible), the standard. No, I don't have any.
- 15 Q. Eye glasses.
- 16 A. No. Oh, I do have, yeah, that's new for me. So I do have glasses.
- 17 Q. Is that far or --
- 18 A. I can see fine far. Again, I'm new the whole glasses thing. I just --
- 19 Q. Okay. Glasses for (indiscernible). I'm sorry. For senior.
- 20 A. I guess I've got to get used to that.
- 21 Q. When were you hired at Envoy?
- 22 A. April of '13. No, I'm sorry. April 13th of '23. Sorry. April of '23.
- 23 Q. So you're career progression at Envoy. Were you hired as a FO or a direct
- 24 entry?
- 25 A. Direct entry captain.

1 Q. Direct entry captain. Have you flown this airplane before?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Previously.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Who was that with?

6 A. Republic Airways.

7 Q. Okay. If you could give us the CliffsNotes version of your background
8 prior to Envoy.

9 A. Most of my time was Endeavor on the CRJs, like 15 years, basically the 2-7
10 and the 900 on the CRJs at Endeavor. I had a medical, so I was out for a couple years. I
11 became an instructor, did ground training and -- yeah.

12 Q. So who were you a ground instructor with?

13 A. Endeavor.

14 Q. Okay. And which airplane were you teaching?

15 A. The staircase.

16 Q. Staircase.

17 A. Yeah, all of them. I did the recurrent, systems, indoc, upgrade, pretty
18 much the gambit of the ground schools.

19 Q. Okay. And were you captain at Republic?

20 A. Republic, no.

21 Q. Endeavor?

22 A. Endeavor, yes.

23 Q. Okay. When was your most recent training or checkride or LOFT?

24 A. It was like 2 months ago maybe.

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. Yeah, I had a line check like 2 months ago.

2 Q. Okay. So that's --

3 A. Ballpark ago, about 2 months ago, yeah.

4 Q. Okay. Have you had any previous incidents or accidents as a pilot?

5 A. No. If I could add to that, too, I mean I think this is my third ASAP report
6 I've ever even submitted. So, and the one I don't count because it was -- I was cleared,
7 and that was all an ATC issue. So. I'm not a chronic offender if you want to call it that.

8 Q. Okay.

9 A. So this is kind of new to me, the whole ASAP thing.

10 Q. It's a great program from our standpoint. I think it's one of the best things
11 for safety.

12 A. And I know it's mechanics, controllers, everybody.

13 Q. Dispatchers.

14 A. Yeah, yeah.

15 Q. So if you don't mind, start from the beginning of the day of the incident,
16 September 25th.

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. And just walk us through from when you got up until --

19 A. Sure. Well, it was a late show. So, the FO and I actually, the first flight was
20 the day prior. We flew down to -- from Chicago down to Norfolk. So that was our first
21 flight together. We seemed to mesh really well. I tried to open the door and keep that
22 communication line open. That's important to me. So, we had good conversation and
23 got along well. Landed in Norfolk, went to the hotel and got out. We went our
24 separate ways. Good night's sleep. I went to bed, got up in the morning. I went down
25 and they have a crew room there. So I went down and got a cup of coffee and wanted

1 to get outside and go for a walk. So, like I said, slept well, slept in, my body wouldn't
2 let me any more which I was earlier than I'd like but. So, yeah, I got a cup of coffee and
3 went for a walk outside along the harbor there.

4 And actually ran into Alex while I was out walking. He was out doing the
5 same thing. And we chatted for a bit. I said, hey, let's meet for lunch. So we -- later on
6 we met up in the lobby and walked down and got something to eat, and back to the
7 hotel to get ready to head out in the van.

8 Nothing special. I mean nothing, you know, everything was pretty
9 uneventful from that point. But arrived at the airport. Got to the airplane. Didn't feel
10 rushed or anything. Preflight seemed normal. There were no mechanicals or anything
11 with the aircraft.

12 Preflight planning based on the arrival and the ATIS that we had going to
13 Chicago. We were assigned the Watson 4, and based on the ATIS, we were landing
14 west. So we had to land on runway 2-7 right. From there, everything, boarding and
15 everything, you know, started up taxi, takeoff, everything was normal. Nothing stands
16 out in my mind for that kind of stuff.

17 As we leveled off, we started, you know, thinking about the arrival into
18 Chicago and everything. So I pulled up ATIS, and they had -- at that point, they had
19 switched the airport around. So they went from landing west to landing east. So with
20 that said, I went into the MES (ph.) and I switched it to the reciprocal of 2-7 right which
21 is 9 left. We loaded that. I don't know if we briefed right away or if we waited a little
22 bit. I think we just -- I like to get things done and he's brand new. So if I recall correctly,
23 you know, we just talked about it and got it done.

24 Shortly later, we got another ATIS and they had switched -- they were
25 indicating landing 9 center, which I remember I had a little discussion with that, that's

1 weird, because they usually take off 9 center, but -- so all right. Again, we switched it.

2 We loaded 9 center and briefed it again.

3 I do want to emphasize that we followed procedure, company procedure
4 as, you know, we put it in the box, we both review it, we verify it, we activate it, we brief
5 it, and for every single run, all five, we did exactly that. We didn't cut corners. We
6 briefed every single one of them. We verified and activated every single -- every time
7 we got a runway change. I know, you know, corners can get cut. We did not do that.

8 So -- all right. So -- sorry. 9 left, and then a new ATIS later came out said 9
9 center. So we changed to that. Not too long after that, and I know if we were talking to
10 Chicago yet or not, but they changed our arrival into Chicago from the Watson 4 to the
11 Spo (ph.) 5. So with that said, we looked at the runway again, and changed it to -- this
12 is where it gets -- so that one, I'm changing to 10 right coming in from the south
13 corridor there. So, 10 right.

14 As we started our descent at -- I think it was right around Lacy (ph.)
15 sometime, they -- we talked to approach, and they switched us to plan on runway 10
16 center. He was the pilot flying, and we're below 10,000 feet. So with that said, I'm like
17 you focus on the flying. I'm going to do all the work in the box, and I had him verify it.
18 And then I said, well, you're flying. I'll brief it. So I briefed 10 center, and proceeded
19 on the downwind. We got the turn on the base and all that stuff. And, where it gets a
20 little fuzzy for me is, you know, they gave us -- at some point we turned inbound and
21 normally somewhere in there, you're going to get the identifier. Are you familiar with
22 what I mean?

23 Q. Yes.

24 A. Like on the approach plate, there's a 4 letter identifier to indicate you're
25 receiving the correct signal. Normally, you're going to get that somewhere in there,

1 and we didn't get it. Again, I verified this numerous times but didn't get that signal, but
2 they gave us a turn to intercept it. We have the FMS up. I know we had it set correctly
3 in there because as a new FO, he asked if I would put him a 1 mile ring around RAYYY
4 which was the final approach fix. Sometimes guys like that just for a reference with
5 configuring and different things like that.

6 So I know RAYYY was in there and the tower also gave us a 170 to RAYYY
7 contact tower at RAYYY instruction. So I know RAYYY was in there. When they gave us
8 a vector it was either -- I thought it was 0-6-0. He mentioned 0-7-0. Same direction.
9 And we were just -- it wasn't lining up. There was something not correct on that, but
10 we had the magenta course, the computer course.

11 So, you know, at that point, and again we could see the airport or
12 whatever. But at that point, he just went heading mode, and started towards RAYYY at
13 that point. So we follow the magenta course. In the back of mind, like, okay. We're
14 still magenta. We're not getting the approach, but we've got the airport right there.

15 So we crossed RAYYY and I'm busy kind of -- I'm multitasking. I'm in the
16 box trying to like, okay, why aren't we getting this. I'm double checking the frequency.
17 I checked the prog (ph.) page. I checked the radio page to make sure the frequency
18 was correct. Checked the jet page making sure everything is lining up. Still wasn't
19 getting any kind of signal. But I know we're on course because we can see on the
20 magenta, the computer, is showing RAYYY right there.

21 And so I'm kind of monitoring him, you know, his flying. At some point in
22 there, I do remember -- I felt like we were a little bit high. We didn't have a glide path
23 because we didn't have ILS, but we felt like we were a little high, and he was -- and we
24 had talked about this day before. He was using automation to get down, and I didn't
25 feel like it was going quick enough. So I disconnected autopilot, and I got us down a

1 little quicker. I just -- I wanted to make sure we were stable at 1,000 feet, which we had
2 plenty of time to do that.

3 But at that point, like I said I was kind of back and forth inside and outside,
4 and when I looked out, I saw the airport. I'm like do you have it. He said, yes. I said, all
5 right. You have the controls back because he had better situational outside the aircraft
6 than I did because of the back and forth.

7 So I'm back inside. We're coming up. We get to RAYYY. We might have
8 been a hair past RAYYY but I looked up, 170 to RAYYY, and so we're configured, and
9 we're doing everything we're supposed to be. We're stable. There was no unstable,
10 anything like that. I called tower, said, you know, visual 10 center, at which point they
11 cleared us to land.

12 We continued flying the aircraft configuring and ran the checklist, and we
13 proceeded inbound. I did try to keep troubleshooting a little bit. I mean I was
14 frustrated. I was like why is this not, you know, like multiple times. I even had him, you
15 know, he redid it, too. Yeah, that's the right frequency. I mean we were both double
16 checking the frequencies. Quadruple checking, you know. Why isn't this coming? I
17 had a theory, but I don't know why it wasn't tuning at the time. But, like I said, we
18 crossed RAYYY, called tower, cleared to land and proceeded to land. We hit the field
19 initially. At some point in there, I went, I went with the automation. So.

20 Q. Okay. Thank you for that. I'm just going to back up and ask questions
21 kind of as we sequence through. Was this the leg to Norfolk, the first leg of this trip?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Okay. So it was just two legs so far. Had you ever flown with this FO
24 before?

25 A. No.

1 Q. Okay. Was this trip scheduled or were you on reserve?

2 A. We were reserve.

3 Q. Were you on I believe what we call airport or ready reserve or were you at
4 home or --

5 A. No, I was there at the airport. Yes, I was airport.

6 Q. Okay. How familiar are you landing at Chicago?

7 A. That's a tricky question. You know, I thought of this as well. I was
8 thinking, how many times have I landed on this runway? I could probably count on one
9 hand. I haven't landed on 10 center much. I usually come in -- my trips are from the
10 Midwest or from the west. So most of the -- I'm sorry. I can't talk either. Most of the
11 runways I land on I land on 2-7 right a lot or on the 10 right on the south side a lot
12 because I'm coming from the Midwest when I come in. So, I was thinking the same
13 thing. I'm not as familiar with 10 center because I just -- I haven't landed on that runway
14 very much at all. Usually if I'm going to east, I'm coming from the Midwest, I'm landing
15 on 10 right or I'll land on 9 left. So I'm usually on one of the end runways.

16 Q. Yeah.

17 A. Very rarely do I get lucky enough to get the middle runways. So.

18 Q. Okay. So maybe you said less than a handful of times --

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. -- you've landed on 10 center.

21 A. And that's again, to my best recollection.

22 Q. Yeah, that's fine. Have you flown into Chicago quite a bit, like before
23 Envoy?

24 A. No. Maybe once I think in my 20 years, once I think I flew in there.

25 Q. Okay. Are you aware of any special guidance that Envoy has concerning

1 Chicago?

2 A. I'm not aware of any special guidance.

3 Q. Okay. Do you happen to know the distance between runway 10 left and
4 10 center?

5 A. Not off the top of my head, no.

6 Q. It's 1200.

7 A. 1200 feet.

8 Q. It's close.

9 A. Close.

10 Q. So reading the crew statement --

11 A. I actually was there.

12 Q. -- what was your perception of the traffic situation --

13 A. There was none.

14 Q. -- coming into Chicago?

15 A. There was none. I mean it was -- I actually eventually noted like, man, this
16 is quiet. This is super dead here. There was -- I mean there were no other airplanes on
17 tower frequency that I recall. I heard a couple other on approach but that could be,
18 you know, anywhere. But there was no activity on tower or even on the runways. There
19 was nothing that I saw.

20 Q. So there was nobody, as far as you know ahead or behind?

21 A. Nope.

22 Q. And you didn't see anybody on the runway?

23 A. Negative.

24 Q. Okay. Let's see. I think I understand most of where you got the runway
25 changes. When you first checked on Chicago, is that when you got 10 right?

1 A. Well, they didn't assign 10 right when they switch our arrival to the ESSPO
2 just based on looking at it, and again this isn't 100 percent always accurate, you know.
3 You base it on experience like, okay, are they going to land us 10 center? Are they
4 going to land us 10 right? Well, if they land us 10 center, we're going to have to cross
5 10 right. Well, that doesn't make sense. So that's why I went with 10 right --

6 Q. Yeah.

7 A. -- is because I'm not going to cross over other traffic to get to the other
8 runway. The my best assumption was, okay, they're going to put us on 10 right.

9 Q. Sure.

10 A. That's -- and again, that's not -- it's a roll of the dice, but.

11 Q. So, you didn't actually get assigned 10 right from ATC. That was just you -
12 -

13 A. I believe -- not that I recall. I believe when we got to ESSPO 5, we were
14 looking at, okay, what runway is everybody using. Yeah, 10 right makes the most
15 sense.

16 Q. Sure, I totally understand.

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. There are many times like what runway are we taking?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. Use what makes sense. So, you stated that you guys briefed every
21 runway, and you said that you went ahead and briefed it for him for 10 center because
22 you knew you were going to be going below 10, and --

23 A. Well, I didn't want to -- we're below 10,000 feet. So that's a busy, you
24 know, that's sterile cockpit kind of thing, and this is pertinent obviously. So, sterile
25 cockpit is aside from that, but I wanted him to focus on the flying part of it, and I could

1 do the briefing without pulling him, you know, drawing his attention away from the
2 flying part.

3 Q. Yeah, his flying the airplane. So do you recall when you briefed it, how
4 did you brief the runway itself? Like -- so we know the approach for (indiscernible).
5 What else did you include in that?

6 A. I have a standard way, whether it's visual or IMC. I just brief everything.
7 I'm like okay. The -- let me get the right approach here. 10895 -- okay. You know, if I
8 just go through the standard. Okay. The frequency is 10895. We've got ISXH is the
9 identifier that we're looking for. Our inbound course is 0-9-3. That checks with what
10 the previews and what the FMS says. RAYYY is our final approach fix. We'll cross
11 RAYYY at approximately 2300 feet. Bottoms are 869. So if you have 870, it's a cross
12 check to make sure we're both set. The MSA is 3400 feet all around. And then we
13 talked about the missed approach. I'll read that, you know, verbatim, if we have to go
14 miss. It's going to be up to 4,000, 0-9-3, blah, blah, blah. We got PAPIs on the left
15 side. ALSFs weren't a player because it was day, visual, and then the rollout, exit left or
16 right depending on what runway we're landing. So. Okay. So I pretty much like I said,
17 I have a standard way. Granted if it's weather, you know, if they've got weather down
18 to a minimum, I'm going to be more methodical, more thorough on and giving the
19 details because it's weather. And this, it was visual and -- but like I said, I pretty much
20 brief it standard that way all the time.

21 Q. I don't know if you know the answer to this question. Does Envoy have
22 two different styles? Does it have to be this way where you give the full meal deal on
23 visual and instrument approaches? Can you do a shortened version? Is that in your
24 manuals?

25 A. There is. You can alleviate a couple of things on a visual, you know, but

1 there's guidance on that.

2 Q. Okay. I'll look at that later. This one's about the -- that question. I haven't
3 had a chance to look through all the manuals yet, but -- so were there any pertinent
4 NOTAMs?

5 A. No. As far as I know. We check NOTAMs. We've got a lot of runway
6 changes --

7 Q. Yeah.

8 A. -- and I guess we kind of pride ourselves of checking the NOTAMs out.
9 Neither one of us recall seeing anything that was applied to us, to our situation.

10 Q. Okay. Did you see a PAPI?

11 A. I don't recall seeing a PAPI.

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. I can't say I was necessarily looking. Like I said, it kind of bumps back and
14 forth. So I don't recall. I can't say I didn't see it, but I don't recall seeing it.

15 Q. Okay. Were you trained here at Envoy on conducting visual approaches?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And what training did you get training on it? Was it in a simulator or --

18 A. No, sims are hard to do visuals in. So, more, you know, LOE stuff when
19 you're, you know, when the situation is appropriate and you can shoot the visual.

20 Q. Is that the same as IOE?

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. How many visual --

23 A. I said LOE. IOE. Sorry.

24 Q. That's okay. How many would you -- do you recall how many visual
25 approaches did you do during IOE?

1 A. I couldn't even guess.

2 Q. More than one.

3 A. I would say more than one, but one for sure.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. Plus I've done numerous since then.

6 Q. Okay. So, it seems like you were doing the best you could to manage the
7 workload as you're coming in with the runway changes. At what point did you feel like
8 the -- at what point did you realize on the downwind that there was an issue with the ILS
9 frequency not tuning?

10 A. I don't know that I necessarily realized that. You know, I guess I'm okay,
11 why is it -- you know, sometimes they take longer to tune. Sometimes one side will
12 tune and the other won't. But -- so, you know, I was still kind of waiting for it to tune.
13 And then when they gave us the heading to intercept, I'm like we still don't have it. But
14 I'm looking -- oh, okay. So my initial thought was, okay, I did something wrong. All
15 these runway changes, you know. So that's where I started troubleshooting on that. I
16 do this because my iPad's over here. So I'm in the FMS, I'm like 195, that's there.
17 There's no identifier, you know. So I'm troubleshooting, trying to, I'm back in, it is the
18 right approach in there. You know, I'm kind of doing this troubleshooting. And I don't
19 remember -- I remember we're getting close to RAYYY, and at some point, I just went,
20 you know what. The airport's right there. I can see the airport, you know.

21 Q. Um-hum.

22 A. Let's just proceed visually. I guess I've learned over the years that, you
23 know, if the automation isn't working, you're still a pilot. Be a pilot, and I could see the
24 airport right there. So, I can't get the automation to work, and I see the airport. Let's
25 proceed visually. And, you know, we had the RAYYY. We had the final approach fix.

1 So, it's 4 miles -- approximately 4 miles out. So at that point, I'm like, all right. I need to
2 focus more on the flying part of it versus the automation. We've got the field. Let's
3 continue visually and when I check in with tower, I said, you know, visual 10 center.

4 Q. Okay. So I'm just trying to be like a fly on your shoulder. As you're
5 coming in and, you know, you're getting the box below 10, I'm just trying to -- what
6 were you feeling? Were you feeling like you -- when did you feel like you were being
7 rushed or something was wrong? Do you remember the steps?

8 A. Really nothing. I mean everything was normal. Again, we -- every time we
9 got a runway change, we, you know, methodically updated the FMS, verified. Hey,
10 there it is. You've got this. You know, there's runway 10 right, the frequency and all
11 that, ILS. And confirmed and activate, and then we'd brief it. So, I didn't feel -- I mean,
12 you know, at least he was below 10. Okay. Now, we're pressing it a little bit, but it's
13 not the first time that that's happened below 10. So again, we -- I did everything like
14 we were supposed to, and since he was -- getting back to he was flying. So I briefed it.

15 Q. Yeah.

16 A. I really didn't start thinking something was wrong until we got that vector,
17 and I'm looking at it. Like where's the course. Something's off here. And, you know,
18 that's kind of where things get a little, okay, we made the turn. I remember thinking
19 something's off. I don't remember what I thought was off. That's bugging me. But we
20 made the turn, and I'm like something's off, but -- okay. We had the magenta course.
21 So he, you know, he basically like, well, I'm just going to fly the RAYYY and be of the
22 magenta. In the back of my head I'm thinking, okay, well, we can't shoot the approach
23 in magenta. We've got to be in green. At some point in there, I went to VL on that
24 which is green needles, and I still wasn't 100 percent confident with that because I still
25 didn't have the identifier.

1 Q. Right.

2 A. But I was, like I said, I'm still troubleshooting, you know, trying to figure
3 out why this isn't tuning. When I did to go to VL NAV, I got some course that was way --
4 in thinking about it after the fact, it was like it was a reverse sensing. Like it was the -- it
5 was telling us to go the wrong way when we should have been going, you know, it
6 would have taken me off course. So I didn't trust that. I didn't have an identifier with
7 that one either. But it felt like it was -- you know what reverse sensing is?

8 Q. Um-hum.

9 A. That makes sense. Okay. So again, it took me a while to come up with
10 that but like I said, at this point, I'm out of the box. I'm like, let's just proceed visually. I
11 asked him, he's got it. We crossed RAYYY on approach, tower cleared us to land. We
12 were on at that point. So we continued visually.

13 Q. So, I believe you had a vector first of 360, and then 0-6-3. Does that seem
14 -- does that --

15 A. Yeah, I think the 360 was the base turn I believe, and then -- yeah. And
16 that (indiscernible) for me. I know Alex had talked about that. I remember -- I think that
17 was our base turn.

18 Q. Yeah.

19 A. And then somewhere in there we got another turn, yeah. I don't
20 remember that stuff. I just remember the 0-6-0 to intercept.

21 Q. Do you remember where you decided to go VL or green needles?

22 A. I thought it was at or around RAYYY somewhere, but I'm not positive on
23 that.

24 Q. Okay. Did you feel comfortable with how the FO was flying the airplane --

25 A. Absolutely.

1 Q. -- during this period?

2 A. Yes, absolutely.

3 Q. Like you weren't worried about being new and --

4 A. No, and again, I was trying to balance -- I didn't feel uncomfortable with
5 him, but at the same time, I'm also -- I know he's new. So I'm balancing him. I'm like,
6 airspeed's on. He's doing a good job, you know. Looking at the bricks on the runway.
7 I'm like okay. We got a good glide path coming down and, no, I had no issues, you
8 know. The one part was, I just felt like we were high, and he went to automation right
9 away, and again my mentality is something you've got to override the automation. So
10 that's where I'm like, okay, let's get down a little bit, and then I gave it back to him. But,
11 no, he did a great job.

12 Q. When you say he can go back to the automation, what does that mean
13 because he was hand flying at this point or --

14 A. No, no, he -- that wasn't until later. So, like we're coming in on the
15 approach, and I felt like we were a little high. So he started dialing in -- I don't know if
16 he dialed in FPA or vertical speed, but I'm like I wanted to get down a little quicker than
17 the automation. It's like if you had TCAS event, you know, the vertical speed, click,
18 click, click, no, you're going to disconnect and you're going to hand fly it. So I wanted
19 to get down a little bit, but get that initial thing going and then once we got, you know,
20 that going, then, okay. Now, we're -- I feel comfortable. You got it. Yes. All right. You
21 have the aircraft.

22 Q. At what point on final?

23 A. That was somewhere around -- all this was kind of around RAYYY.

24 Q. Okay. I'm trying to think.

25 A. That might have been a little before RAYYY.

1 Q. Yeah. You know, looking at the crew statement you gave me, I see how
2 you guys put a mile ring around RAYYY, and you talked about you were using RAYYY
3 kind of as verification that you were lined up. My question is what range were you on
4 you MFD?

5 A. I don't recall the range. I wish I knew that now. I thought that, too. I mean
6 I don't remember what range, but I mean I don't know how much I was, you know,
7 looking at that versus balancing, trying to troubleshoot, watching his stuff and visually
8 outside looking at, you know, versus inside looking at what range I'm at, you know. I
9 didn't really need the range because I could see the airport right there. So --

10 Q. Yeah.

11 A. -- I don't recall.

12 Q. Okay. What do you typically do, you know, every time you land? What do
13 you do personally for your runway verification? What are you looking for?

14 A. Well, you know, for our FOM, you know, when available you're supposed
15 to back up. Even visual approaches, you're supposed to back up, you know, with some
16 kind of instrument approach if it's available which is what we were trying to do. So, on
17 every approach I fly, I back it up with some sort of instrument type approach whether
18 it's, you know, the GPS or if it's got a localizer or ILS, I'll back it up.

19 Q. Yeah. So after your green needles, and it still isn't working, what did you
20 do next?

21 A. I think I gave up on the automation at that point and just, all right, we're
22 just going to continue visually and at that point, you know, it's getting configure time
23 and running checklists and so I focused. So I kind of gave up on the automation at that
24 point, and went, all right, we're, you know, focus on the safe flying.

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. Because again, I was making sure that, hey, are we configuring in time or
2 are we, you know, are we going to be stable at 1,000 feet, et cetera. So backing him
3 up like, okay. Hey, we're this, you know, we're 3 miles out, whatever. Are we getting
4 the gear down. Are we getting the flaps? Are we starting to configure and doing that
5 kind of stuff. I don't remember specifics but I remember, okay, focus on the flying part
6 of it, yeah.

7 Q. Okay. You said when you came heads up, you did a quick count, and
8 then you looked at your iPad to see where you were, lined up and that all jived. Was
9 there any other things that you looked for or didn't see any -- can you think of anything
10 else?

11 A. You know, the only thing that kind of jumps out at me is I have a diagram
12 of -- and I can't, and like I said, if I knew what I did wrong, you know, I'd speak to it.

13 Q. Yeah.

14 A. But, having, you know, this little diagram here, looking at this I noticed
15 that, okay, we got 10 right, 10 left, 10 -- you know, even in my head, I'm like, okay.
16 There's 10 right, there's -- I'm off on my count, you know. I'm like, okay, there 10 right,
17 10 left, 10 center, and I've done that mentally a couple times just even looking at the
18 thing. So I don't know if that's what I did in the airplane. I can't speak to that, but I
19 don't know where I went off on the runway count there. So.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. That's a lot of runways --

22 Q. Yeah.

23 A. -- and taxiways.

24 Q. It is. A lot of wide ones close together. Were there any communications
25 with ATC as all of this is unfolding on final?

1 A. Just checking in with tower at RAYYY, RAYYY tower, Envoy 3936,
2 threshold, 10 center.

3 Q. Did you at any point feel uncomfortable where you should have -- where
4 you wished you would have communicated to them more? Hindsight.

5 A. Yeah. I mean absolutely. I felt good visually, you know, and again, you
6 know, it's been 2 weeks, whatever. I've went over this 100 times in my head. If we -- if
7 it was an instrument approach, for sure. You know, something's wrong. I can't shoot
8 the instrument approach but knowing that we had the runway visually and we just
9 passed RAYYY, we're lined up with 10 center, they are monitoring us. They cleared us
10 to land.

11 Q. Yeah.

12 A. We're on. So I really didn't feel like there was anything wrong. I mean I'm
13 like, okay, we're good.

14 Q. Yeah.

15 A. So.

16 Q. That makes sense. At what point did you know you're lined up on the
17 wrong runway? Had you --

18 A. The rollout.

19 Q. The rollout.

20 A. Yeah. I was like that's essentially, yeah.

21 Q. And then after this, so if you went to the gate, is that when you called
22 ATC?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And what did they tell you?

25 A. I mean it wasn't anything in depth, just, okay, this is 3936, you know, give

1 them my name, and I'm trying to remember. It wasn't anything special. It was just I
2 understand, you know, what we did and trying to remember -- because I called later,
3 like the next day, maybe later that day. I don't remember. But I called them back and
4 I'm like, hey, did anybody else have instrument or, you know, issues with that runway.

5 Q. Yeah.

6 A. And at that point, he indicated no, but the conversation wasn't very long.
7 He just took my name and that stuff, and nothing stands out with the conversation.

8 Q. But you did ask them if they flipped a switch so to speak?

9 A. I did not because I wasn't thinking of that at the time. Honestly, you know,
10 when they changed the runway, I didn't think of that. I mean it took me a bit to, like,
11 oh, shoot, they -- that reverse sensing. It stuck in my head but I wasn't quite figuring it
12 out. I do this because that's where the course was, like why is the course up here.
13 That's why my hand's there. So, yeah, it took me a while to come up with that, I wonder
14 if they didn't flip the switch and that's why, you know, the reverse sense, and that made
15 sense to me.

16 Because I -- when we got to the gate, we shut the engines down and we
17 shut the door, and we SAT there for 20 minutes and we reviewed everything in FMS.
18 The frequency was still in there. The approach was still -- everything was still in there.
19 And so we both verified it. I'm like I don't know how many times I can look at it. It's not
20 going to change. It's the same thing. So, we combed through that thing to make sure
21 everything was set correctly. And that's even after, you know, all said and done. We're
22 not taxiing. Our attention is directed exactly at that FMS, and couldn't find anything
23 wrong.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. And even when I went to VL NAV and I got that other course, that was the

1 green needles, there were still no identifier with that. So I have no idea what that
2 course was to, but it said it felt like it was -- in hindsight, it felt like it was the back
3 course. It was where it was telling us to go. If it would have been flipped, it would have
4 put us up (ph.).

5 Q. Okay. Did you communicate with anybody else? Did you talk to ALPA or
6 the company or -- because you guys, correct me if I'm wrong, you flew to Norfolk. Did
7 you fly to Norfolk after that?

8 A. No, no, the FO did.

9 Q. Oh, okay.

10 A. No, I was done.

11 Q. Okay. Did you make any other phone calls?

12 A. No. In hind -- again, learning from me, this is like I said, I don't have much
13 experience with ASAP reports, you know, basically two in my life. So, I really wasn't
14 sure how the process worked. So, I did reach out to Ed, the safety guy here, and talked
15 to him about that. He instructed me to call the chief pilot for company policy. So those
16 were the two phone calls I made. Like I said, I was kind of learning. I was waiting for
17 the company to reach out to me, and then I would communicate with ALPA as far as,
18 hey, this is what's going on. I think I probably -- I know I waited to long. I should have
19 reached out. It really isn't relevant to this situation but, yeah. So.

20 Q. Okay. Let's see. But you have filed an ASAP. That's all been taken care
21 of?

22 A. Yes.

23 MS. BLUM: Okay. I think I'm going to end my questions there, and pass it
24 off to Kat.

25 DR. WILSON: Thanks.

1 BY DR. WILSON:

2 Q. I think we've going about an hour now. Do you need a break?

3 A. I'm fine.

4 Q. Stretch your legs. No, you're okay.

5 A. Yep, I'm good. Thank you for asking.

6 Q. I have a few follow ups to the questions that have already been asked, and
7 then other things. I apologize if you said this, what was your date of hire?

8 A. I think it was April 13, '23.

9 Q. You've been there a year and a half-ish?

10 A. Yeah, yeah.

11 Q. And again, sorry. Where are you based?

12 A. Chicago.

13 Q. The runway switches, have you -- do you have any idea why, you know,
14 why they put you on 10 center? Was that closer to your gate? Was it going to be less
15 taxi time or any thoughts on that?

16 A. I don't think Chicago cares about taxi time. So, no, I mean I'm not sure
17 why that -- I have no idea how they -- I quit trying to figure that out how they selected
18 which runways they're going to use.

19 Q. Okay. And I think you said you didn't realize you had landed on the
20 incorrect runway until you were rolling out?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. Okay. And again, I get this is hindsight, but at what point, you know,
23 when would be a good time to abandon troubleshooting, go around, just completely,
24 you know, get outside, you know, the cockpit, look outside? Help me reach your
25 thought process?

1 A. Sure.

2 Q. In a normal situation, you know, if you had the wherewithal during that
3 situation to think about it, like when, when should you have been like, okay, time out?

4 A. Well, I can't speak to other times but, you know, in this particular time
5 when my thought process was, you know, we're proceeding inbound. I've troubleshot
6 as much as I think I can. I can't find anything wrong, but -- so the automation is
7 worthless to me. It's not helping me at all.

8 Q. Um-hum.

9 A. But I have the airfield right in front of me. So, in my years, it's like be a
10 pilot, right, and fly the airplane. So, I abandoned the automation point, knowing that I
11 couldn't figure out if it was our error or what -- if I, you know, programmed something
12 erroneously or what. So -- but we're, you know, at the final approach fix, or possibly
13 even inside of that. It was time to focus on flying the airplane. And so like I said, be a
14 pilot. I gave up with that. I had calls to make to ATC. I needed to monitor the FO and
15 his flying. I needed to run checklists. So at that point, I'm just like, all right, we're
16 visual, we got it, let's just focus on the flying part of it.

17 Q. And so was that at or around the final approach fix?

18 A. Yeah, it was. That's safe to say.

19 Q. You mentioned that you were a little high, and you made the motion of,
20 you know, pushing on the controls to get down in altitude. And when you mentioned
21 that you gave the control back, you said it was a positive control. Was there a positive
22 exchange of controls when you initially took control?

23 A. I don't recall. I can't say for certain.

24 Q. And I'm going to put you on mute for one second.

25 A. Sure.

1 Q. I apologize.

2 (Off the record.)

3 (On the record.)

4 BY DR. WILSON:

5 Q. Okay. And do you recall what altitude that was at when you initially took
6 control and then when you handed control back?

7 A. I can't say for certain. I mean I can't say for certain when it was, but
8 probably between 3 and 4,000. I'm guessing on that.

9 Q. Okay. And this was your last leg, correct?

10 A. Yes, ma'am.

11 Q. Were you going back on reserve or were you going home?

12 A. No, I was done.

13 Q. And were you flying out that night or did you -- were you staying the night
14 in Chicago?

15 A. No, I had a flight home later that -- hourly flights between Chicago and
16 Minneapolis. So.

17 Q. Did you already have a flight booked or do you --

18 A. No.

19 Q. -- normally book that once you land?

20 A. Yeah, once I land.

21 Q. Okay.

22 A. I jinx myself if I do it before I land. So, it'll never happen.

23 Q. Okay. And there were multiple flights available to you after that?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Okay. In the year and a half or so that you've been with Envoy, have you

1 ever done a go around?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. What were the circumstances of that?

4 A. Unstable approach. I know I've done go arounds. I'm trying to think of a
5 specific time. You know, if you're not stable, below the 1,000 feet, you know, you're
6 descent rate is in excess of 1,000 or airspeed's off, you know, the criteria there. I'm
7 trying to think of like where, when. I get old airline, previous airlines go arounds mixed
8 up with it. So I don't have a specific but, yes, I've done go arounds.

9 Q. And it's been typically for unstabilized approaches?

10 A. Yeah, I would say that's fair. I don't recall like traffic or any other thing or
11 ATC calling or anything. So.

12 Q. And when you do a go around at Envoy, do you have to tell -- do you have
13 to report to anybody afterwards, do any paperwork?

14 A. I'd have to look that up. If I do a go around and if I'm not sure if I have to
15 report that, I usually go in the FOM and look it up and then, you know, they all have
16 different times, you know, it's 12 hours, 24 hours, 48 hours, et cetera. So if I was to go
17 that, I'd have to go in the FOM and just make sure I'm complying with the timeframe
18 and whether it's required or not because there's a gambit of reports that are required
19 for various reasons.

20 Q. Okay. Would you say that Envoy has a no-fault go around policy?

21 A. Oh, yeah, yeah, I would say that, sure. Yeah.

22 Q. And this aircraft, was this a different aircraft than you flew into Norfolk?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. When you did look outside the cockpit, any obstructions to your vision at
25 all and to your view? Sun, anything environmental or on the aircraft itself?

1 A. Like I said, the one thing I remember is how quiet it was, and I mean there
2 was -- I didn't even see an airplane taxiing around. I mean it was just -- the runways,
3 taxiways, radios, everything was clear. There was nothing going on.

4 Q. And thinking about back to your training, have you gone to current --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- also?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Okay. So I guess you could specify for me whether it would be initial or
9 recurrent training, but does Envoy provide any training on human factors?

10 A. Yeah, I think the classroom portion of recurrent has some human factors.

11 Q. Do you recall any of the topics that were covered?

12 A. If you give me some examples. I mean just -- I don't know.

13 Q. Anything like cognitive biases, tunnel vision, continuation biases, those
14 type of things?

15 A. I mean those all sound familiar. Whether I got it here at Envoy or a
16 previous life somewhere else, I can't say for certain but I mean, you know, I've been
17 doing this 20 years. So I've been through couple of human factors classes and -- so,
18 yeah, I mean that's stuff, yeah. Expectation bias, yeah, all that kind of stuff. Yeah, sure.

19 Q. I have a few more. I don't think I have anything else related to the event.
20 So I will ask you some questions about your 72 hour history leading up to the event,
21 but I'll wait for round 2 to do that. Thank you so much.

22 A. Yeah. Thank you.

23 MS. BLUM: Gerard.

24 MR. SMITHERS: So he's running out on the questions.

25 MS. BLUM: Tim.

1 BY MR. GRAHAM:

2 Q. You say you've been here a year and a half. You're still on -- you can't
3 hold the line or do you bid reserve?

4 A. No, I can't hold the line.

5 Q. Can't hold the line yet.

6 A. I did for a couple months.

7 Q. Yeah, and then it changes. So you're on -- do you bid airport standby
8 every day or --

9 A. It's situation awareness. Like I'll bid it, the 1500. It's kind of convenience
10 like if it's day 1, I can commute in at 1500, and sit on airport standby. And --

11 Q. So this was the last day. Did you bid airport -- proffer for airport standby
12 for this trip or how did you get it?

13 A. I didn't bid for it. I was assigned on reserve. I was sitting in for standby. I
14 don't remember if I -- I think I bid for 10 a.m. airport standby. I kind of like that because
15 I get used. I'd rather -- I prefer to get used than sit in the crew room all day.

16 Q. So, when you're on reserve, since you've been on reserve, when was the
17 last time you flew before that? What's your, you know, recency of flying?

18 A. Let's see. I did an Indy, a one leg. I was reserve. I did -- I remember this.
19 I did an Indy to Chicago. Or maybe I did the out and back.

20 Q. That was reserve--

21 A. It was the 23rd. So this is -- yeah, so the 23rd. And then I was like --

22 Q. How about the rest of the month? Did you fly a lot that month?

23 A. It looks like just like, you know, onesies, twosies here and there, you know,
24 not a trip or anything but, you know, like I did a Rochester, flight to Rochester,
25 Minnesota, then repoed an airplane back. Yeah.

1 Q. So enough that you didn't feel rusty?

2 A. No, I didn't feel rusty. I don't recall, you know, getting the cobwebs out.

3 Q. All right. Was this a 170 or a 175? I guess the basic question is did it have
4 a printer?

5 A. I think this one had a printer.

6 Q. Did you have keep any of those ATIS printouts by any chance?

7 A. No.

8 Q. The fact when you realized something --

9 A. No, I did not. Where is -- there it is. I don't know. I've got the tail number.
10 772Mike Romeo. Let me see.

11 Q. That one does have a printer.

12 A. Okay. Man, you know that, huh.

13 Q. Yeah.

14 A. No, in hindsight, I should have grabbed all the paperwork.

15 Q. Do you recall what the winds were? Were they out of the south or the
16 north? Because they had been out of the -- either southwest, west, when they had
17 originally been landing to the west, but they must be shifting to land --

18 A. I know it was light winds, 6 knots, but I can't say for sure.

19 Q. More out of the south or the north?

20 A. I don't know for sure. I would be strictly guessing if I said something.

21 Q. You mentioned a couple times that you were below 10,000 feet at Lacy.

22 A. Somewhere around there. I was looking. I was trying to remember that,
23 too, like were we below 10 at Lacy? That seems --

24 Q. It seems unusual --

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. -- because with Lacy on that star, (indiscernible) --

2 A. (Indiscernible) --

3 Q. -- and you're departing and they're sending people south at 5,000 feet,
4 they generally hold you at 10 until around Monks (ph.), and then give you 7 and then 5
5 when you're passing Georjo (ph.) and usually you're at 5,000 feet prior to Possum (ph.)
6 before they turn you.

7 A. Yeah, and I mean I could be off on that, too. I know when we checked in
8 with approach, and so I don't know where we would have got the approach -- check in
9 with approach. To this point, we would have 10 right in there, and so at some point,
10 wherever we got switched to approach, is when, you know, they said plan on 10 center.
11 I know, but I can tell you for sure, that we were below 10 because that's why I took the
12 aircraft or why I briefed it is because I wanted him to focus on the climb below 10. So,
13 there might be some gap there in when this all exactly happened, but I know that when
14 I was doing the briefing and changing that, that we were below 10.

15 Q. All right. So usually when we set it up, when we put the localizer
16 frequency in, it says FMS auto --

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. -- right?

19 A. Yep.

20 Q. And then when you're in the terminal area, and it says term, and it says
21 previews available.

22 A. Previews available, yeah.

23 Q. So you go ahead and select preview, where do you identify that you have
24 actually tuned in the correct --

25 A. Well, you can do it on the prog page or you can look at the letter

1 identifiers up on the PFD.

2 Q. Right.

3 A. And when they're --

4 Q. So that's an ILS DME.

5 A. And we never got either one.

6 Q. So if you never got either one, if you said it's not showing up, sometimes
7 even if it is an ILS DME, the DME identifier doesn't show up on your MFD.

8 A. Yeah, but it wasn't on the prog page either.

9 Q. So that should clued you in, one, that this may not be set up right.

10 A. Yeah, and that's why I was troubleshooting. That's exactly why -- what is --

11 Q. Where were you when that -- were you on the downwind because that's in
12 the terminal area, the downwind?

13 A. Yeah. So it doesn't always preview or auto-tune at the same time. I mean
14 I've experienced where sometimes it'll, you know, it'll do it way out there, you know.
15 It's available. Well, in this case, I guess I was still kind of waiting to see if it was going to
16 auto-tune. It never auto-tuned. So, you know, basically like as we're turning in, they
17 give us that vector. I'm like something's off here. Something, you know, something
18 isn't working. Something's not set up correctly.

19 Q. All right. So, just to see if you understand the way it works, how can you
20 just say automation isn't working. How can you force that localizer frequency?

21 A. Put it in manually.

22 Q. You put it in.

23 A. It was, it was --

24 Q. Was it at the top or the bottom?

25 A. Yeah, it was in there.

1 Q. In the top?

2 A. Yeah, like I said, we reviewed all this, even at the gate, and it was still
3 there. And I don't, I don't -- like I said, I don't know what was off on it. Okay. If it's not
4 auto-tuning, that's what you do. You hard tune it. That's what we call it.

5 Q. Hard tune.

6 A. Yeah. I'm familiar with hard tuning.

7 Q. Okay. So when he's telling you turn 0-6-0 to intercept the localizer,
8 cleared visual, 1-0 center, and the FO armed NAV which we are taught to do --

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. -- did you select VL or did you remain in intercept in NAV?

11 A. So that's where we got a little fuzzy. I thought we stayed in NAV. I
12 thought we did it after we captured. And, I think he was saying I did it before. I don't --
13 I thought we captured -- because I saw the NAV. I mean that's how we do it. We
14 capture a NAV.

15 Q. Right.

16 A. So I thought I let it capture. I mean I could be wrong, but I thought -- I
17 mean I know how that works. You capture a NAV and then you're pointing inbound.
18 So I thought I selected VL after we had captured it. That's my recollection of it.

19 Q. But if you didn't have the right frequency and it didn't --

20 A. Well, that was --

21 Q. -- why select VL?

22 A. Well, and that was my -- part of my troubleshooting. I'm like I even -- I
23 think I mentioned that in my report. I'm like, I still don't have the identifier. So I don't
24 know what, you know, I selected VL NAV or VL just like -- I still don't have the identifier.
25 So I don't know really what good this is going to do but, you know, I was kind of

1 troubleshooting at that point. And that's -- like I said, that's when I saw the course off to
2 the north. I get -- I agree with you -- I still didn't have the identifier. So --

3 Q. You didn't have the identifier.

4 A. It wasn't --

5 Q. So why push the button?

6 A. I guess I was trying to -- like I said, at some point I was trying to just bypass
7 the part of my troubleshooting, trying to bypass the computer altogether like he said,
8 and hard tune it, and that didn't work either. So.

9 Q. Did you ever just think about rearming the NAV? If you rearm the NAV --

10 A. I thought about it after the fact, yeah. It just -- everything was happening
11 so fast, and again, I'm troubleshooting. I'm outside. I'm inside. I running checklists
12 and doing everything that I could. Yeah, in hindsight, NAV would have been great. I
13 get it.

14 Q. You said since -- you said to yourself, we can't shoot the approach in
15 magenta. Have to be in green. Why do we have to be in green?

16 A. I guess we're, you know, we had it in our minds we were backing up with
17 it, I was. So I said that. I know we do shoot GPS approaches in magenta. So, it's kind
18 of a play on words I guess.

19 Q. Does our FO1 or AO1 on a visual approach --

20 A. Yeah, we could back it up in magenta.

21 Q. No. Does it say have to have anything?

22 A. No, it doesn't.

23 Q. It doesn't.

24 A. No. Which is why, like I said, when the automation wasn't working, that's
25 why we ditched it.

1 Q. So I was asking about the winds, because if you went a heading and the
2 winds were out of the south, the heading isn't going to track.

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. You could be flying 0-9-3 --

5 A. And it's going to blow --

6 Q. -- and it's pushing you.

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. And he said you had your head down troubleshooting, and you think he's
9 going this way, but he's inexperienced and doesn't realize that he's getting pushed this
10 way, and you saw a runway, and they're only 1200 feet apart, and you saw a runway
11 and you have your head in for 20 seconds going 170 through RAYYY, and you look up
12 and you see the same runway, okay, we must be still on course. Now, he just got
13 pushed. So that's what I was wondering.

14 A. I've been racking my brain trying to figure out, you know, where we went
15 wrong, trust me. I'm kicking myself for, you know, well, what happened? So I'm open
16 to feedback. I'll take anything you've got, if I can learn something from it, absolutely.

17 Q. All right. Well, you said you're familiar with landing on 10 right. You do
18 that a bunch, right?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. What's to the right of 10 right?

21 A. Just a road.

22 Q. Nothing, right. A road.

23 A. Yeah, yeah.

24 Q. What's to the left of it?

25 A. Taxi, Lake (ph.) taxiway and then the terminal and --

1 Q. For FedEx and UPL, right?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. So, if you're coming and you look up and you think you're on 10 center,
4 and you see a runway to the right, 10 center, to the right of it should be all those FedEx
5 buildings and everything.

6 A. Yeah, I guess I wasn't looking for FedEx buildings. I was --

7 Q. Well, I mean I'm just saying that there's different ways to identify the
8 runways as opposed to counting.

9 A. Yeah.

10 DR. WILSON:: Let's take a break. Hold on. All right. I just want to make
11 sure that we're staying focused on questions related to the event versus explaining
12 things and coaching about things that we can look for when we're coming into this
13 runway environment. So, maybe we can just take a 5 minute break, and then we'll -- we
14 can do like a little group, regrouping, and just make sure that we're going in the right
15 direction. And then we'll come back if that's okay.

16 MR. GRAHAM: Sounds great.

17 CAPT BACHAND: Sure.

18 MS. BLUM: Okay. We're stopping at 4:17.

19 (Off the record at 4:17 p.m.)

20 (On the record at 4:28 p.m.)

21 MS. BLUM: Okay. We're back on the record at 4:28. Okay. So, Tim, did
22 you say you were done with questions.

23 MR. GRAHAM: Yeah, no more questions.

24 MS. BLUM: Okay. Gerard.

25 BY MR. SMITHERS:

1 Q. A couple questions. When you said you're doing the briefings, you said
2 the briefings were done correctly per the FOM. So at each time, did you make positive
3 changes or was there any time that you were starting to get rushed that you briefed it,
4 you set it up and you briefed for him? Do you understand what I'm saying?

5 A. You're talking transfer of controls or what are you --

6 Q. Yeah. So the full transfer of controls as per our FOM --

7 A. Um-hum.

8 Q. -- okay, because there was so much going on, was there a time towards
9 the end that you were getting a runway change that you at that point then set it up and
10 then briefed it for him while he was still flying?

11 A. The last -- I believe just the last one, the 10 center was -- otherwise, we
12 transferred controls. We did everything --

13 Q. Excellent.

14 A. -- per the manual.

15 Q. Just that one there when you were getting so close.

16 A. And when we were below 10, and I just -- below 10, I didn't want to
17 transfer controls back and forth and -- yeah. So --

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. -- with the situation the way it was, I felt it was like, okay, we've briefed a
20 couple already. It's already 0-9-3, and let's -- you keep flying. You focus on the flying.

21 Q. Right.

22 A. And I'll get you set up.

23 Q. Okay. One more -- or two more questions. I haven't got very many. So
24 you did -- you're coming on the approach, and I'm assume at that point you thought
25 the first officer was a little high. So you took control of the aircraft. All right. And, I'm

1 assuming he was in a FPA mode at that point, and you preferred to get down. Did you
2 just disengage your pilot and pitch down or did you go through a certain mode?

3 A. It didn't -- I bypassed the auto mode automation.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. Again, I felt like we were -- I don't know if we were high. It just may be my
6 perception seemed high.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. I'm like let's get to a, you know, I don't want to get behind is what --
9 initially, I don't want to get high and then unstable and everything else. So, I think I just
10 got us down a little bit quicker, all right, and then you've got the runway? Yes. All
11 right. You have the aircraft, and then we were able to proceed, and he did a great job
12 flying on visual approach.

13 Q. So when you got back to the comfortable position you w3ere at, was this
14 past the final approach fix?

15 A. I believe it was before.

16 Q. Still before.

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. So, you were comfortable at that point handing --

19 A. Back to him, yeah.

20 Q. Okay. Now, you said you came in for a R24. So you just had training just a
21 few months ago, correct?

22 A. Correct.

23 Q. Okay. And that was -- it was a full R24, correct?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. Correct. Okay.

1 MR. SMITHERS: I'm done.

2 MS. BLUM: Okay.

3 MR. SMITHERS: Thank you.

4 MS. BLUM: Let's see. I think I am good for round 2. I'm going to pass this
5 off to Kat. I have a couple of questions at the end but, Kat, I'm going to pass it to you.

6 BY DR. WILSON:

7 Q. Okay. What did you think of flying with the first officer? How did he
8 compare to other first officers you've flown with?

9 A. I didn't notice anything out of the ordinary. I mean he's brand new. I fly
10 with a lot of new guys, you know, right out of training. I -- like I said, I try to open myself
11 up. I try to remember where I came from. I was a new FO once and, you know, it's
12 intimidating sometimes depending on who the captain is. So I try to put them at ease.
13 I was -- I'm very humble, you know. I try to let them know, I know you're new, but if you
14 see me doing something and you don't understand it, speak up. I'm big on
15 communication. So if you -- like if you're like what the hell's this guy doing? You need
16 to say that aloud, right. Don't be afraid of offending me. If I'm doing something
17 incorrectly, I'll correct it. If I'm doing it correctly, then I'll explain why I'm doing it, and
18 we both, you know, we can learn something. So, I felt as a pilot, he was -- you know, he
19 was anxious to learn. So we talked about some different things. You know, we talked
20 about different things with the automation, and he was eager to eat it up, and he was
21 keep it coming. I'm like I don't want to insult your intelligence. He goes, oh, no, keep it
22 coming. So, yeah, we established a good rapport. Like I said, we had lunch the next
23 day, and I felt like we communicated really well. I didn't have any issues with his
24 piloting skills. He did a good job.

25 Q. Thanks for that. As I mentioned before, I want go over your 72 hour

1 history.

2 A. Sure.

3 Q. I know it can be sometimes tough to think back a few weeks, your
4 activities and sleep and wake times. If you've got a calendar that you want to pull up,
5 that's okay, too, or if you've got your schedule, but I'd like to go back to September
6 22nd which was a Sunday.

7 A. Okay. Let me -- Sunday, Sunday. All right. The 22nd of September.
8 Okay.

9 Q. Do you recall what time you woke up that day?

10 A. I mean I pretty much do the same thing every day. So, my body clock
11 usually gets me up, you know, 8 o'clock-ish. That's almost an average, yeah. 7:30, 8
12 o'clock. I might try to fight and go back to sleep. Sometimes I can. Sometimes I can't,
13 but for the most part, I -- my calendar's going to help me with the 22nd. I think I was off
14 that day. Yeah. So I would have been at home. Probably slept in, got up, watched
15 football.

16 Q. Okay. Do you nap when you're off duty?

17 A. Once in a while I guess. It's not a regular thing. If I'm sitting there TV and
18 I'm bored, I might but, yeah, it's not a scheduled event for me. So.

19 Q. Okay. And that evening, do you recall when you might have gone to
20 bed?

21 A. I'm usually about a 10:30 p.m. guy.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. I start thinking about it at 10. So between 10:30, 11 o'clock is -- are you
24 talking about the 22nd still or the night before --

25 Q. Yes, the 22nd.

1 A. Yeah. I mean I'm pretty consistent, 10:30, 11 o'clock-ish.

2 Q. And when you get into bed do you watch TV --

3 A. No.

4 Q. -- or do you read or do you fall asleep pretty quickly?

5 A. I'm good at falling asleep, yeah.

6 Q. All right. So no problems falling asleep. Do you have any problems
7 staying asleep throughout the night?

8 A. Sometimes, yeah, I wake up in the middle of the night, toss and turn for a
9 little bit and then fall back to sleep. That's kind of what I was getting at, is like
10 sometimes it's nice to go back to sleep but -- yeah, it's hit and miss. It depends on the
11 stress in my life.

12 Q. Did you have any stress in your life on September 22nd?

13 A. I mean since this has occurred but, no, I mean I don't recall anything out
14 of the order as far as sleep habits or like I said, I'm pretty consistent, but my wife goes
15 to bed before me. I'm usually a half an hour behind her. So.

16 Q. Monday, the 23rd. Do you recall what time you might have woken up?

17 A. All right. 23rd. Okay. So I think I had to -- I think I was on reserve that
18 day. So I would have had to get to Chicago from Minneapolis. So that was the -- let me
19 see. Yeah, I think that was the first day of my reserve. So I probably slept in. Like I said,
20 I bid for the 3 p.m. So I probably slept in, got up, got some breakfast, caught a flight
21 down. That got me -- you've got to give yourself two flights. So, you know, probably
22 had a late morning, early afternoon flight to Chicago. So, yeah, nothing unusual.

23 Q. And when you get to Chicago, do you have a hotel, a crash pad, where do
24 you go?

25 A. Well, that particular day, I think I was going onto -- if it's the correct day, I

1 was going onto airport standby. So I would sit there until -- hang around the crew
2 room or somewhere in the airport until approximately 10 p.m., and then if I remember
3 correctly, I went to the Sonesta Hotel which is a nice hotel.

4 Q. And then on Tuesday, the 24th, what time did you wake up?

5 A. The 24th. All right. The 24th.

6 Q. Actually, back up for a second. I didn't ask you what time you went to
7 sleep on the 23rd?

8 A. Like I said, it's pretty standard for me, 10:30, 11 o'clock. Actually that's
9 pretty much every night, it's going to be 10:30, 11 o'clock unless I'm working or
10 something, but --

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. And then like I said body clock usually gets me up -- mean, if I can sleep
13 past 8, I'm happy. So. So you said which day now? The 24th.

14 Q. Now, we're on the 24th.

15 A. 24th. Okay. So, that I think -- now, we're getting into where I had to go
16 for a 10 a.m. reserve. So airport standby. So, I probably got up, got something to eat,
17 went from the hotel over to the crew room, hang out in the crew room for a little bit. I
18 usually go, there's a quiet room in back, dark, but nobody there. It's just like a sleep
19 room. So I go back there and kind of hide out until -- I think that's when I got the call to
20 go to Norfolk. So.

21 Q. So if you've got a 10 a.m. airport standing, what time would you -- would
22 you still have woken up around 7:30 or 8?

23 A. Well, that I don't have a choice. That's just kind of body clock. It's when it
24 wakes me up. Yeah, like if I can, I'll sleep in, or I'll try to lay there until 8. I mean if I
25 have to be there at 10, then, you know, probably it's a 10 minute train ride to the crew

1 room. So probably 9 o'clock-ish, I got out of bed, maybe earlier, 8:30.

2 Q. And then you flew to Norfolk. Again, bedtime, are you thinking 10:30, 11
3 o'clock or --

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. -- is that different?

6 A. No, kind of the same thing. I mean we didn't, you know, we didn't have a
7 show time until like 2:30, yeah, 2 o'clock-ish or whatever the next day, 12:30 van,
8 whatever it was. So, I wasn't real concerned with, you know, going to bed super early
9 or anything but, you know, like I said, probably 10:30-ish, 11 o'clock again.

10 Q. Do you recall any problems falling asleep or staying asleep?

11 A. No.

12 Q. And then on the morning of the event, you didn't have -- it was a 2 p.m.
13 show you said, but do you recall what time you got out of bed? What time you woke
14 up and then when you got out of bed?

15 A. I would say probably 9-ish, you know, like, I said. I got up at 9, and then
16 walked down, got a cup of fancy coffee in their crew room there, and wanted to get
17 outside and just go for a walk, get some fresh air, a little exercise, and I felt good.

18 Q. Okay. So that brings me to, you felt good that morning. Did you have --
19 how did you feel during the flight on the approach?

20 A. Yeah, no issues. I felt, I felt awake and alert.

21 Q. How would you rate your health on a scale of 1 to 10?

22 A. 8 1/2, 9, I don't know. I don't have any issues that I've found yet.

23 Q. And you --

24 A. I'm not on any medications. I'm not doing vitamins and nothing like that.

25 So.

1 Q. Any recent illnesses or injuries?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Any major changes in your financial situation?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Any recent changes either good or bad in your personal life?

6 A. Family life, no. I'm good.

7 Q. Great. Okay. I think that's all the questions I have. I really appreciate it.

8 Thank you so much.

9 A. Thank you.

10 MS. BLUM: Thanks, Kat. Tim, any questions?

11 MR. GRAHAM: No questions.

12 MS. BLUM: Gerard?

13 MR. SMITHERS: I'm good. Thank you.

14 BY MS. BLUM:

15 Q. Let's wrap this up. Is there anything that we haven't asked you that you
16 would like to share with us or questions you wish we would have asked?

17 A. I mean I used to be in your seat. In my previous life, I did safety and
18 accident investigation. I worked with the Board before.

19 Q. Oh.

20 A. Not for the Board but with the Board in an accident investigation, airplane
21 crashes and stuff. So I mean nothing. Just know that, you know, I'm taking away
22 something from this, you know. I've definitely learned and I'm kicking myself for the
23 situation. So.

24 Q. Looking back with hindsight, why do you think the incident happened?

25 A. I mean I've struggled with this for, you know, still struggling with it, like

1 why couldn't I get that tuned in, and I -- because I still think there I am again, that
2 course is up here. Like I still think I don't know if they didn't flip switch. I don't know
3 what happened there. I would be very curious to see if there's an answer to that. Why
4 we landed on the runway? I wish I had that answer. I mean obviously I'm trying to -- I'm
5 hopeful to learn from this as well. I want to take something -- I definitely want to take
6 something out of this as well. In 20 years, like I said, I've been a good boy. I mean -- so
7 it's frustrating for me as, you know, as a pilot, as an individual. I did 26 years military,
8 too, and I never had any issues. So, you know, I'm frustrated with myself. So I don't
9 know why it happened or, you know, I know moving forward, you know, I'll be a lot
10 more cautious and, you know. I wish I had the answer. If you have it, please let me
11 know.

12 Q. Hopefully we will get to the bottom of it. Once we get through the
13 investigation, we should have some better answers.

14 A. Okay.

15 Q. I really appreciate your time.

16 A. Thank you.

17 MS. BLUM: And we will go off the record at 4:43 p.m.

18 (Whereupon, at 4:43 p.m. CST, the interview was concluded.)
19
20
21

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceeding before the

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF: WRONG RUNWAY LANDING AT THE
CHICAGO O'HARE INTERNATIONAL
AIRPORT IN CHICAGO, ILLINOIS
ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2024
Interview of Bradley Bachand

ACCIDENT NO.: DCA24LA318

PLACE: via Microsoft Teams

DATE: October 8, 2024

was held according to the record, and that this is the original, complete, true
and accurate transcript which has been transcribed to the best of my skill and ability.


Kathryn A. Mirfin
Transcriber

CAPTAINS WRITTEN STATEMENT

RE: Envoy 3936

KORF - KORD

Sept 25.2024

Description

First flight of the day for the crew. Departed KORF approximately 1430 local. Flight had multiple runway changes throughout the flight. Preflight...planned 27R per ATIS and the Watson4 RNAV arrival. Enroute, ATIS indicated the airport had turned around so we changed our arrival runway to 9L. Shortly thereafter, we received a new ATIS indicating they were now using runway 9C, so we loaded the FMS with 9C and completed an approach briefing. Not too long following that, Center called with a new arrival changing us from the Watson4 RNAV to the ESPO5 RNAV. With that change, we again changed our runway to the 10R approach. Finally, after checking in with App. Control, we were assigned runway 10C. (So we made 5 runway changes in total). Timing is a little fuzzy, but I do remember that we were below 10,000 feet when we were setting up the approach to 10C. With that said, I instructed the FO to focus on the PF functions while I tended to setting up and briefing the approach. Note: we did check the NOTAMS and I don't recall anything affecting the 10C Localizer. I'd like to add that each and every runway change we made in the FMS was confirmed by both pilots and activated and each and every change was briefed accordingly.

As we proceeded closer to the airport, (downwind) I was waiting for the frequency to tune in (Identifier ISXH), so that we could preview the approach, but we never received it (PROG page or PFD). I immediately reviewed the radio page to double check the frequency (as did the FO) and it was set properly. I also double checked the PROG page and it was showing correctly, but we still didn't have the identifier. I can also verify the FMS was set correctly as we entered a 1 mile ring around the RAYYY FAF for the FOs reference (brand new FO). We also referenced it for the ATC speed and "contact tower" instructions.

At some point, we were turned to a 360 heading (base turn) and eventually a turn to 060 to intercept the final approach course. To the best of my recollection, we were instructed to maintain 170 to Rayyy (FAF) and contact Tower there. We complied with these instructions, however even though it was visual, we were backing it up with the ILS..10C (frequency 108.95). Again, the set up and review were all accomplished. Unfortunately, we still were NOT getting a valid localizer/ILS signal

The confusion started when we were given a 060 heading to intercept the final for 10C. We still didn't have the identifier, so we couldn't identify the course in green needles, however, we still had the FMS displayed and had sequenced the approach off of the fix SHARN after selecting HDG mode, so we did have reference to the final via the FMS. At this point, we continued to assume something was off in the FMS. The PF armed the Nav to intercept the inbound course while I continued to investigate the FMS inputs! Initial review didn't reveal anything obvious. The frequency in the radio

page was compared to the Jepp chart, the placement of the frequency on the radio page was confirmed (armed vs. tuned), the PROG page was reviewed, the FMS approach was checked, etc. I couldn't find anything wrong. We still had the FMS course at this point and were able to proceed to RAYYY via the FMS.

I was still heads down trying to figure out if there was an error with my programming. Not able to find anything erroneous in the box, I went back to heads up and contacted Tower and reported visual 10C at or about RAYY at which point, they cleared US to land 10C. Having been heads down, and not having the lateral guidance and/or outside situational awareness that the PF had, I immediately attempted to verify that we were properly aligned. I did a quick count of the various runways ahead of us and it appeared we were on course. I also relied on the fact that we crossed Rayyy on course, had checked in with Tower and were cleared to land with no corrective vectors. At no point was there any conflict with any other traffic, nor did we hear anything further from Tower. That was the last communication we had with Tower until mid rollout where they instructed us to contact them for possible pilot deviation

Our mentality at RAYYY was that we were backing this up with the ILS and needed to be in Green needles per company procedure. We had both verified the frequency multiple times at this point.

In a desperate attempt get the localizer for reference and hoping we might get some guidance in green needles, I selected VL Nav (knowing I still didn't have the identifier) but just to bypass the FMS and basically go to the "hard tuned" option. It was a long shot but it didn't help since we were still not receiving the identifier, (however it gave me insight (later) as to what occurred). With that said, when I selected VL Nav, we did get a course to appear, however at the time, that course made no sense to me as it was showing us to the south and was directing us to continue even further North than we already were. We did not agree with that as we had the airport and course visually straight ahead. There was also no identifier associated with this course, so I didn't trust it. In hindsight, I believe that was the reverse course for 10C. (This would indicate that we had the correct frequency inserted AND tuned!)

I continued to troubleshoot in between monitoring the FO's flying, communicating with ATC and completing PM duties. At the time, it didn't occur to me to stay with the FMS as we had the airport visually and we were still uncertain of what was going on in the FMS. It got to a point where I needed to focus on the approach, the PM duties and the safety of the flight, so I abandoned the automation.

The visibility was unrestricted, the winds were approximately 4 knots on the nose and the airport was directly in front of us. We were at or just past RAYYY, so we opted to proceed visually as we had the runway in sight directly in front of us. There was absolutely no other traffic in the area at the time and as I recall, I didn't even hear any other aircraft on the frequency. I do remember looking out at the airport and mentally noting how quiet it was. I neither heard nor saw any other aircraft even taxiing on the airport at the time of our arrival. We proceeded visually and landed on what we thought was runway 10C. During rollout, Tower instructed us to contact them for possible pilot deviation. After clearing the runway at taxiway, Yankee, we paused for a moment to collect ourselves and grasp the reality of what had just occurred. At this

point, we called the Tower and verified what we already knew...that we had landed 10L instead of 10C. Again, there was no conflict with any other traffic.

CAUSE

Based on the information I currently have available, my thought is that when the airfield was switched from east to west, the tower never switched the direction of the approaches i.e. flipped the switch. This would explain why we didn't receive the ILS identifier and when switching to VL Nav (green needles), we received what appeared to be reverse sensing. Having verified the frequency multiple times, I feel assured that we had the proper frequency and it was tuned properly. If the frequency had remained in anything other than the "tuned" position, we would not have even received the reverse course that was displayed

On the Human Factors side, I wish I would have communicated with ATC of our situation and verified our position to alleviate the error. In hind sight, after taking the time to mentally review this, I should have communicated our issue to ATC and asked for assistance and/or executed a missed approach and come back around to try it again. I think my mentality (at the time) went to "Oh, we have it visually, we don't need the automation").

SUGGESTION NARRATIVE

For me...my take out of this is regardless of conditions, if I'm having a navigational issue (VFR or IMC), communication is one of your best resources. Even though I felt confident proceeding visually, had I just communicated with ATC the issue that we were having, it could have mitigated this error.

The FO and I thoroughly debriefed this event after the shutdown checklist was complete. Together, we reviewed all the entries in the FMS. The 10C approach was properly loaded and the ILS frequency was still set. It boiled down to the fact we never received the ILS signal and based on our course leaving the FAF with no corrections from the Tower, we ultimately believed we were on the correct course. Tower was contacted once we parked at the gate. There was not much substance to that conversation other than confirming what had occurred and that appropriate follow up action would be required.

Capt Brad Bachand

Emp [REDACTED]

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

Investigation of:

*

*

WRONG RUNWAY LANDING AT THE
CHICAGO O'HARE INTERNATIONAL
AIRPORT IN CHICAGO, ILLINOIS
ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2024

*

* Accident No.: DCA24LA318

*

*

*

Interview of: ALEXANDRE J. BEAUMONT, First Officer

Envoy Airlines

via Microsoft Teams

Tuesday,
October 8, 2024

APPEARANCES:

STARR BLUM, Operational Factors Investigator
National Transportation Safety Board

DR. KATHERINE WILSON, Human Performance Investigator
National Transportation Safety Board

TIMOTHY GRAHAM, Check Airman
Envoy Airlines

GERARD SMITHERS, Aircrew Program Designee (APD)
Envoy Airlines
Air Line Pilots Association (ALPA) Representative

MATTHEW HUNTSMAN
Representative for FO Beaumont

INDEX

<u>ITEM</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
Interview of Alexandre J. Beaumont:	
By Ms. Blum	81
By Dr. Wilson	78
By Mr. Graham	83
By Mr. Smithers	91
By Ms. Blum	91
By Dr. Wilson	92
By Mr. Graham	98
By Ms. Blum	100
By Mr. Graham	100
By Ms. Blum	100

INTERVIEW

(1:25 p.m. CST)

MS. BLUM: Okay. Today is October 8th, 2024, and it looks like it's 1:25 Central Standard Time.

My name is Starr Blum, and I'm an operational factors investigator, and this is Dr. Kat Wilson. She's a human performance investigator, and we're leading the team working for the investigation Number DCA24LA318 involving Envoy Flight 3936.

The NTSB is an independent federal agency. We're not part of the Department of Transportation or the FAA. We have no regulatory or enforcement powers. Our mission is to determine the probable cause of accidents and incidents and make recommendations so similar events can be avoided.

Our mission does not include findings of liability or blame. Your participation today just helps ensure that the fact finding phase of the investigation is complete and accurate.

We will be recording this interview so that it can be transcribed. After we receive the transcript, our group will review it for typos and incorrect acronyms before it's included in the public docket. We can provide you an opportunity to review the transcript, too, if you would like to.

I would like to introduce the members of our group. Can you briefly introduce yourselves here. Kat.

DR. WILSON: Katherine Wilson. I'm a human performance investigation with the NTSB.

MR. GRAHAM: Tim Graham, Chicago line check airman, 7 years with Envoy, retired military.

MR. SMITHERS: Gerard Smithers, APD, Envoy, been with us 24 years,

1 former Royal Marine, representing ALPA today.

2 MS. BLUM: Thank you. So, each member will have two opportunities to
3 ask questions. We'll be taking turns. Everybody's been instructed not to interrupt each
4 other, and we ask that you just answer the questions to the best of your recollection.
5 There's no right or wrong answers. If you don't remember, that's a perfectly fine
6 answer. Again, we're just trying to learn from your experience and get an education
7 from your view of the incident. If you don't understand a question, just say so, and if
8 you feel like your misstated something and want to correct it, just do that as well. And
9 again, if you need to take a break, whether it's to confer with Mr. Huntsman or use the
10 bathroom, just say so.

11 You are entitled to have a representative of your choosing during this
12 interview. Is there someone you would like to have as your representative?

13 FO BEAUMONT: No. Mr. Huntsman.

14 MS. BLUM: Thank you, Mr. Huntsman.

15 MR. HUNTSMAN: Of course.

16 MS. BLUM: Can you please state and spell your name for the record?

17 MR. HUNTSMAN: Matthew Huntsman. That's M-a-t-t-h-e-w, and
18 Huntsman is H-u-n-t-s-m-a-n.

19 MS. BLUM: Thank you. So please refrain from answering any questions.
20 Is it okay if I call you Alex?

21 FO BEAUMONT: Yes. I go by Alex.

22 MS. BLUM: Okay. Please refrain from answering any questions on his
23 behalf. You can direct him not to answer and take a short break to confer. Sound
24 good?

25 MR. HUNTSMAN: Sounds great.

1 MS. BLUM: Okay. Does anybody have any questions?

2 FO BEAUMONT: No, ma'am.

3 INTERVIEW OF ALEXANDRE J. BEAUMONT

4 BY MS. BLUM:

5 Q. Okay. Let's start with just the basic stuff. Can you please say and spell
6 your name?

7 A. My legal name is Alexandre Joseph Beaumont, A-l-e-x-a-n-d-r-e, J-o-s-e-
8 p-h, Beaumont, like Beaumont, Texas, B-e-a-u-m-o-n-t.

9 Q. Okay. And how old are you?

10 A. I'm 46 years old.

11 Q. And your employer?

12 A. I work for Envoy.

13 Q. And your job title?

14 A. I'm a first officer.

15 Q. And your base?

16 A. I'm based in Chicago.

17 Q. Okay. So any managerial or training role?

18 A. No.

19 Q. It doesn't have to be exact, but can you ballpark what your total time is?

20 A. 1660.

21 Q. And what about your time in type -- the Embraer 175?

22 A. I'm type rated in the E-175, and I've got 75 hours of actual time.

23 Q. Okay. Do you have previous PIC time at another airline?

24 A. No, no, this is my first 121 job.

25 Q. Okay. Medical certificate.

1 A. Class 1.

2 Q. And do you have any limitations?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Okay. And what was your date of hire at Envoy?

5 A. Official date I believe it's March 11th, 2024.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. April 11th.

8 Q. Okay.

9 A. I apologize.

10 Q. Can you give us a CliffsNotes version of your aviation history prior to
11 Envoy?

12 A. A CliffsNotes?

13 Q. Yeah. A brief history or summary?

14 A. I was a flight instructor.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. I had no time of my own until my commercial, and then I became I CFI,
17 CFII. I worked at a Part 61 school.

18 Q. Okay. Here at Envoy, what was the most recent training event or
19 checkride that you have here or LOFT?

20 A. I was parting my LOFT at the end of my simulator training. I don't recall
21 exactly. Sometime in July.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. Early July.

24 Q. This year. Have you been involved in any previous accidents or incidents?

25 A. Negative.

1 Q. Okay. So, let's just start from the beginning. Can you walk us through,
2 you know, the beginning of the day, of September 25th, and walk us through like
3 going to work up until, through the incident, recalling as many details as you can?

4 A. Yeah. I remember sleeping in, and I went for a little job around town, fast
5 walk, a few hours. I ran into Captain Bachand at the dock as I was coming back. I was
6 probably gone at least a couple hours, maybe a little longer. Him and I agreed to get
7 lunch together, and after lunch, we went and changed and met up in the lobby and
8 head out to work. We were a little bit ahead of time, not behind, no rush. And I
9 remember in the van like looking at the details of flight, the weather and so on and
10 ATIS in Chicago and just getting familiar with what was coming our way.

11 Then our preflight, nothing unusual. No MEL, no SMEL (ph.) on the
12 airplane. I remember especially like looking at the gear pins and recording that. Then
13 we entered the route. I got clearance, and we verified the route, and I was flying. So, I
14 expected to have runway 2-7 right in Chicago. I remember mentioning that. So we
15 completed the briefing. We taxied off a little bit earlier than scheduled, and then we
16 took off, no issues.

17 We got to the flight level and then we got the ATIS, and we realized that
18 the ATIS was advertising (ph.) runway 9 left. So we got the briefing and completed the
19 briefing on 9 left, and we carried on, just normal flight, no rerouting, nothing major. As
20 we got a little closer, a new ATIS had came out. So we took the new ATIS out of
21 Chicago, and they were no longer advertising 9 left but 9 center. So I completed
22 briefly on 9 center. The best I can recall, we exchanged command after I did the
23 briefing like we were supposed to and vice versa. And then went on and were about to
24 get on the arrival. We were supposed to the WATSN 4 arrival. As we're close to about
25 30 miles out of WATSN, we got contact with Chicago and Chicago told us to expect the

1 ESSPO 5 arrival instead of the WATSN arrival, and we were directed WATSN at that
2 time.

3 We look at the new ATIS. Captain did the FMS, the MCD work, and then
4 we look at the ATIS and based on the new arrival, we were going to expect runway 10
5 right. So after the arrival was entered in, I did the briefing. We cross checked the
6 weight plan on the new arrival, and I briefed runway 10 right. As we carried on, we
7 were past Spo, between LAACY and IZARD.

8 Q. Do you mind? Can we just -- okay.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: This is the one that they thought they were
10 going to get which is a west landing.

11 MS. BLUM: Yep.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Do you want that to be a reference? Would
13 that be easier?

14 FO BEAUMONT: I have one.

15 MS. BLUM: Oh, okay.

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He's got one.

17 MS. BLUM: Okay. Great.

18 FO BEAUMONT: : I brought a few visuals from so I can to keep
19 everything in chronological matter.

20 We were past LAACY or around LAACY. I don't recall exactly the time.
21 After we were assigned new altitude and Chicago approach told us to expect runway
22 10 center which was not the one we were expecting. We were expecting 10 right. At
23 that time, we were about 10 nautical miles out, going 300 knots. So 9 minutes from
24 time to turn. I was descending and I asked the captain if he wanted to take the
25 command so I could do the briefing, and he said you're busy flying. I will do the

1 briefing. You fly the airplane. We descended below 10,000, and then we turned on
2 the downwind. Well, at sometime we got below 10 and got cleared to 7,000 feet on
3 the downwind.

4 As we are flying the downwind, the captain did the briefing, and I could
5 clearly see the runway, you know, unrestricted visibility and I did notice at that point, it
6 was very quiet. There was no plane ahead of us. There was no plane lined up to land.
7 It was a desert which never happen in Chicago but there was not a sole around.

8 The captain did the briefing, asked me if I had any question, and I asked
9 him at that time if he could put a 1 nautical mile ring around the final approach to
10 RAYYY for the runway 10 center. As we carried on, we got down to 5,000 feet on the
11 downwind, and we were getting closer to POSSM which was the final fix on the arrival,
12 and I remember the captain telling me like what I was going to do if we POSSM, trying
13 to quiz me and making sure we were on the same page. I was like we're going to head
14 on and wait for a turn.

15 But we never got the POSSM. We were given a turn to 3-6-0, a couple of
16 miles before POSSM. I don't exactly recall the distance, but we were close to it but not
17 on it. And at that point, the captain sequenced the approach of Sharm (ph.), I'm sorry,
18 SHARN which is the fix at 5,000 feet on the FMS. We were getting 3-6-0 heading from
19 ATC and I turned the plane to 3-6-0 heading on the heading mode. And I engaged
20 preview. Preview did not come on the needle, and I don't recall exactly the direction
21 that the blue needle gave me but it was not the 90 degree intercept that I was
22 expecting at that time, and that's when I started noticing something's off.

23 We carried on, on the 3-6-0 heading, and ATC gave us a 0-7-0 or 0-6-0
24 heading. I believe it was 0-6-0 to intercept the localizer. I engaged the nav mode to
25 intersect FMS and I was about to turn to heading mode, and at that point, the captain

1 overruled me and said use the VL mode. So we engaged VL. When engaged VL, the
2 green needle appeared and the deflection was pegged to the left which I was kind of
3 surprised because at that time ATC had give us a 3-6-0 heading for a little while. That's
4 the reason I did not expect to see to the left but maybe was still right, of course. I
5 rectified my course localizer on 0-9-3 before I made the turn, and I made the 0-9-3. I
6 was kind of hustling doing that, and then I did the turn, the 0-7-0 turn to set the
7 localizer.

8 At that point, the needle never moved. I remained pegged to the left,
9 and I realized there was something wrong. And I was not getting a glide slope on the
10 PF's side. So something was off. As we kept going on 0-7-0 heading, I could see on
11 the MFD the course that the captain activated and I elected to use the heading selector
12 on the plane to join the localizer. At that time, as I was turning and doing this, the ATC
13 came in on the radio and says, Envoy, join the localizer and clear for visual approach,
14 contact tower at RAYYY. So I was not getting a needle. I had a clear visual on the
15 runway, and as far as I could see, I was lined up towards RAYYY, the final approach fix
16 for the approach.

17 The captain was heads down, trying to figure out what was going on with
18 the frequencies. As we were gliding and when we got clear for the approach, I
19 selected FPA (ph.) 3 degrees was down, and started descending towards the final
20 approach fix.

21 A short time later, and I don't know how long, the captain looked up and
22 says, whoa, we need to get down and engage the flight level change so we can get
23 down a little bit quicker. I don't recall how, somehow we exchanged role. I don't know
24 if I told him to take the airplane or if he called my airplane. I don't have the exact
25 recollection how we exchanged role, but we did. And we were halfway through

1 between maybe SHARN and the final push at that time descending to the final
2 approach altitude.

3 As he was flying, I put my head down and double checked the
4 frequencies of the localizer. I could see they were correct. At that point, I came back
5 heads up, and I maintained a visual on the runway, and the captain asked me since we
6 were both heads up, looking outside, we had a stabilized descent from what I can
7 recall, and he says, you got it? I was like, yeah, I got it. I can fly my airplane. And, I
8 started descending towards the runway.

9 I maintained my scan of the runway before the final approach fix and all
10 the area, and I could see it was literally -- there was no one around, no one ahead of us,
11 no one on the taxiway, no one had landed. There was no one ahead of us on the MFD,
12 and that never happened. The south side was empty, except about sometime later, I
13 did see a plane crossing the south -- I mean the bottom end of runway 1-0, which I
14 thought was 10 center at the time. And I called to the captain, hey, captain, did you
15 see that plane there, and he came back up, and like the plane did not turn on the
16 runway but kept taxiing off, and got on my side. I said, never mind, it taxied off. So I
17 kept a good scan of everything that was going on at the field at that time.

18 Captain was heads down. We passed the final approach fix. I had, you
19 know, a visual of the runway which I thought was the correct one, came back up and
20 says, do you have the right runway. I was like, yes, I think I do. And, that was before
21 RAYYY. He went back down, and about a mile and half past Ray, came back up and he
22 called tower, and I not realizing at the time that we were past tower, as I was focusing
23 my scan on the runway there. He called tower and tower told us to land on runway 10
24 center.

25 Throughout that whole process, I had thought I was lined up on the right

1 one but when we got clear to land on 10 center, I had no doubt that we were lined up -
2 - we were line up on the right runway. I had just passed (indiscernible), the air was
3 clear and we got cleared for landing.

4 As I said, we passed the threshold, landed. I was about a foot off the
5 centerline, and I apologized for being off the centerline when we were rolling down the
6 runway, we realized that we're not landed on the correct runway. As we were rolling
7 down, ATC called us and told us possible pilot deviation, let us know if you're ready to
8 copy a phone number, taxi. I don't remember the taxi route out to the end there.

9 We taxied off. We paused for a second. We copied the phone number,
10 and we double checked the FMS and the frequencies to make sure they were correct,
11 and we agreed that it was the correct frequencies that he had. Copied the phone
12 number, got taxied off at the gate and then shut down at the gate there. And then we
13 talked about the debrief, you know, what went wrong there.

14 Q. Okay. Thank you. I'm going to back up and try to work some questions in
15 as we go through this. So this was not the start of the trip. Where were you in your trip
16 as far as the schedule goes? When did the trip start?

17 A. That was the second leg between captain and I. We had flown together
18 to Norfolk the night before.

19 Q. Okay. Was this a scheduled trip for you or were you on reserve?

20 A. I was on reserve, and I got called in the day before to pick up that trip.

21 Q. Okay. What's your normal call out for reserve usually?

22 A. Two hours out.

23 Q. Two hours. You were notified the day before of this trip.

24 A. Yeah, the night before which was the 24th. During the day at some point I
25 got called in to do that trip to Norfolk, and then we were going to come back together

1 --

2 Q. I see.

3 A. -- back to --

4 Q. Okay. So you got the call on the 24th, and you flew the 24th. Was that a 2
5 hour call?

6 A. Yeah, yeah, yeah. You mean a call out to call in.

7 Q. I don't know. Do you guys call in or do they call you? Every airline's
8 different. So they called you to say you were going to fly on this trip.

9 A. Correct.

10 Q. Okay. How familiar are you with landing at Chicago or flying in and out of
11 Chicago?

12 A. I'm new. I only have 75 hours. That was my second time landing on that
13 side of the airport.

14 Q. So how many times would you say you've been in O'Hara?

15 A. Under a dozen.

16 Q. Okay.

17 A. Without a doubt, my number 2 landing on the south side of Chicago, on
18 10 center.

19 Q. Okay. Does Envoy have any special guidance concerning Chicago in any
20 of your manuals?

21 A. There's company page. There's company page on the, on the -- at the FD
22 Pro, but nothing special regarding like landing, anything visual.

23 Q. Anything about the close parallel runways, 10 left and 10 center?

24 A. There's -- 10 center is a PRM runway, but it's not a company page.

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. It's a Jeppesen (ph.).

2 Q. Okay. So it sounds like your perception of the traffic, it was slow, that
3 there was nothing -- no planes around.

4 A. The only plane I saw was the plane that I called taxiing at the bottom of the
5 runway, what I thought was 10 center.

6 Q. Okay. So, that airplane, you said you saw it -- it seems like you were inside
7 the final approach fix when you saw that airplane.

8 A. No.

9 Q. When did you see that airplane? Where were they?

10 A. I was about -- that's the picture that I took from Google Earth, and that's
11 about 6 miles out which is about the time that I saw that plane taxiing at the bottom of
12 the runway there. That was about the distance.

13 Q. Were they going north to south?

14 A. They were south to north.

15 Q. Okay. They were crossing. So you had a pretty high workload with the
16 runway changes. So the first one you change once you got up and routed it sounds
17 like. You went from 9 -- you went from 2-7 right?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. And then when you got up in route, it was to 9 left.

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. And then when you were still in cruise --

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. -- it went to 10 center. Is that correct?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. Okay. And then you got 10 right?

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. And that was somewhere around changing from the WATSN to the Expo.
3 Is that right?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. And then you got 10 center assigned by Chicago approach, passing
6 LAACY. So you were still -- were you about 10,000 feet when you got 10 center?

7 A. I do not recall.

8 Q. Okay.

9 A. To the best of my recollection, yes, I was.

10 Q. Okay. Thanks. So, you said -- so the captain, he conducted the steps in
11 the FMS for each runway change and you verified that. How did that happen?

12 A. I verified all of them except the last one, 10 center.

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. Because at that point, I was flying.

15 Q. So he --

16 A. We below 10,000.

17 Q. And he did it for you.

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. Okay. How did you -- when you guys conduct your briefings, how do you
20 brief the runway? Did you brief if there's a PAPI (ph.)?

21 A. We briefed the Jeppesen chart there and, yes, we did brief the PAPI. That
22 runway did not have PAPI.

23 Q. The 10 --

24 A. They did, but they were not working.

25 Q. I was just going to ask. Were there any pertinent NOTAMs for the

1 landing?

2 A. I did not expect to have 10 center. So I have not dig into the NOTAMs on
3 that one, and I did believe -- I don't recall.

4 Q. Okay. And you said the PAPI wasn't working just from you looking out or -
5 -

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. -- because of the NOTAMs? Okay. And that was for 10 left or 10 center?

8 A. 10 left.

9 Q. Okay. Did you print landing performance for all of these runway
10 changes?

11 A. Pardon me.

12 Q. Did you print landing performance for all these runway changes?

13 A. I did not. Captain was pilot monitoring.

14 Q. Did he?

15 A. It was based on weight. So -- and the temperature. So it would not
16 change based on runway.

17 Q. Okay. So, which runway did you -- did he print -- I can ask him, but did he
18 print out performance for any of the runways going into --

19 A. We use the app called RG Land.

20 Q. Okay.

21 MS. BLUM: What is that?

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's the landing app.

23 MS. BLUM: Okay.

24 BY MS. BLUM:

25 Q. Do you guys ever print performance related?

1 A. No, we use this landing app.

2 Q. Okay. So, when you were vectored on final, you said it was a 3-6-0
3 heading and I think -- I don't fly an Embraer. So I think you were still blue needles,
4 right, at that --

5 A. It was magenta.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. So I was in FMS mode in the heading.

8 Q. Okay. And so you said something didn't mesh up. Was the final course?
9 What was it that didn't mesh?

10 A. That we the preview mode, and normally it should have lined up with the
11 final approach course.

12 A. Okay. And what did you see instead?

13 A. I don't recall exactly but it was not, it was not giving me a 90 degree
14 intercept. It was giving me a course off, I'd say north, northwest but it didn't make
15 sense.

16 Q. Okay. So, when did you notice that the FMS wasn't auto-tuning?

17 A. When we went to VL, I wanted to go FMS mode to intercept with the GPS
18 and captain wanted to go VL, and with VL, I should have got a glide slope, and I got no
19 glide slope and the course that it was giving me from VL was 0-9-3. So we had not
20 auto-tuned like to be expected.

21 Q. I don't know what VL is. Is this --

22 A. It's the localizer.

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: PMR/localizer (ph.).

24 MS. BLUM: -- localizer?

25 BY MS. BLUM:

1 Q. Okay. So green needles.

2 A. Green needles.

3 Q. Okay. And how did you -- I realize you're the pilot flying. But did you
4 ever go heads down? Where did you look to see the frequency if it was correct? Did
5 you do that or was the captain?

6 A. It was the captain. At that point, I was flying.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. He was troubleshooting that part.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. And I had to do a turn to intercept the localizer, and I did -- no, rectified
11 my course first to intercept. Then I went 0-7-0, 0-6-0, I'm not 100 percent sure which
12 one it was, to intercept, and then I noticed that I was getting close to the line that was
13 supposed turn inbound to and then the green needles were not moving.

14 Q. Okay. So, did you -- other than that, did you have any guidance other
15 than relying on looking out the window?

16 A. I used the FMD and we had put a ring around the RAYYY, the final
17 approach fix. So using the heading mode, I pointed the aircraft towards the final
18 approach course.

19 Q. What range were you at on the FMD?

20 A. I cannot recall whether it was 2 1/2 or 5.

21 Q. Okay. Let's see. So in your crew statement you said you tried engaging
22 the approach mode. Is that correct?

23 A. Yes, I meant to mention that. I went VL and the glide scope did not come
24 in, and then I tried approach mode without any success.

25 Q. Okay. So again that went back to heading?

1 A. (No audible response.)

2 Q. Okay. And when you talked about switching roles, whether let me fly or
3 he said let me, was that for all purposes for you to rectify whatever was going on in the
4 FMS?

5 A. I do not recall, ma'am.

6 Q. Okay. What other indications would you see or would you look at -- let's
7 say you were the pilot monitoring, where would you look to see that the ILS was auto-
8 tuned? How do you besides the needles being there? How do you check the
9 frequency?

10 A. On our progress page.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. You see on the bottom there, and then on the radio, it will say FMS auto-
13 tunes.

14 Q. Okay. And then if it's not tuning, what can you do? How do they train you
15 --

16 A. You just manually enter the frequencies.

17 Q. Okay. And it sounds like you did that. Did you -- you saw the captain
18 manually --

19 A. I did not. I was at, you know, looking outside, and when we exchanged
20 roles, I remember looking down. It's like I was not wondering if it had auto-tuned or
21 not. I just wanted to make sure the right frequencies was in and it was.

22 Q. Okay. Let's talk about runway verification. Did Envoy have any training
23 about how to identify the correct runway?

24 A. Localizer, you know.

25 Q. Yeah.

1 A. On the visual, you back up the approach with any navigational aide that's
2 available which at that time we didn't have one, and then I manually counted the
3 runway -- mistakenly counted the runway.

4 Q. Yeah. How do you typically ensure -- let's say you are given visuals that
5 you do have the right runway. What's your own personal runway verification?

6 A. I always work with the localizer.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. That was not a normal situation for me.

9 Q. Okay. On the Embraer, when you're approaching the airport, are the
10 runways the same color? Are they different colors? I remember looking at the MFD? Is
11 there -- are they the same?

12 A. As far as the instrument goes?

13 Q. Yeah.

14 A. Yes, they are.

15 Q. They're the same color.

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. Does it have the numbers 10 left, 10 center on the screen?

18 A. I don't recall. I don't know. I will point out though that day the visual, like
19 you can see on the runway, you can clearly identify that this is the landing runway
20 because you have all the tire mark on it. That day, that runway had just been cleaned.
21 So all the runway looked the same.

22 Q. Looked the same.

23 A. And the only one that had like tire marks on it is the one that I landed on.

24 Q. Okay. Yeah, I see they just cleaned it.

25 A. Did they really?

1 Q. I don't know.

2 A. I'm assuming they had just cleaned it because I don't remember seeing,
3 and I jump seated on a flight to Chicago to go meet with Mike last week, and I
4 remember like landing and then that's when I noticed that the landing runway on the
5 north side had like tire mark all over it, and I didn't have that when I was landing on the
6 south side.

7 Q. Okay. So, you did -- you said you didn't realize that you took 10 left until
8 the wheels had touched down. Is that correct?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. Okay. And then going back, like when the issues started, were there
11 communications with ATC about the localizer frequency not --

12 A. No, I was the pilot flying. I was busy navigating, you know, flying,
13 navigating.

14 Q. Sure.

15 A. And the communications was, you know, (indiscernible) at the time.

16 Q. Did the captain talk about communicating to the air traffic control?

17 A. Not that I can recall.

18 Q. Okay. Was there any talk about a go around?

19 A. Honestly, we were past the final approach fix. We had a stabilized
20 approach. There was no air -- there was no aircraft in the area, no conflict. We got
21 clear. When we got cleared, I was sure that I was on the correct runway, and a go
22 around crossed my mind, if I was not going to get the stabilized approach, if it was
23 going to be a plane in the area. None of that came to light. So there was no safety
24 issue with the flight, no conflict with any other aircraft. So at that point, that was, you
25 know, it didn't cross the thought.

1 Q. Okay. So after the -- after you guys landed, was that end of your trip or
2 did you continue flying?

3 A. No, I got another leg to go back to Norfolk that evening.

4 Q. Okay. In Chicago, did you communicate with anybody other than ATC?
5 Did you talk to Envoy or ALPA or the airport?

6 A. No, I did not communicate.

7 Q. Okay. Did you file an ASAP or --

8 A. I have.

9 Q. Okay. When did you file that?

10 A. It wasn't until Thursday night that I got around to send it out.

11 Q. Okay. Just a couple more, and then I'm going to pass it on. Do you recall
12 the last time Envoy gave training on visual approaches? I know you only have 75 hours.
13 Was it in your initial training?

14 A. On my first round of IOE, I landed a visual one time in Dallas, and the
15 captain had trained me to maintain my touchdown zone within windshield just like we
16 do when we instruct kids to land the 172. So, we turn off my flight director and just
17 visually did it. I did it once.

18 Q. Okay. How about in the simulator?

19 A. I may have done a visual simulator I believe. I did the LDA in DC where
20 we have to take the turn there. I think that's the only one time I did it.

21 Q. Okay. That's going to be it for my first round. Thank you. Do you need a
22 break? Are you doing?

23 A. I'm good.

24 MS. BLUM: Okay. Kat.

25 BY DR. WILSON:

1 Q. Hi. It sounds like there was a lot going on the approach. When -- you
2 mentioned that you had another leg to Norfolk that evening. Did you fly that leg?

3 A. Yes, ma'am.

4 Q. And then was there -- I think you came back to Chicago the day after.
5 When did you return to base?

6 A. I flew back to Chicago the day after.

7 Q. Okay. And did you fly or did you jump seat? Was that --

8 A. No, no, I flew. I had a good trip. I flew back with another captain. We
9 had a good trip.

10 Q. You mentioned that at one point during the approach that you said you
11 didn't recall how the exchange of roles happened but that it did. Do you recall what
12 altitude you were at?

13 A. We were, we were between 5,000, initial approach altitude and the final
14 approach fix of 2300. And that's the best I can answer that question.

15 Q. And was that when both exchanges happened or -- because you
16 exchanged and then you exchanged back, correct?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. Okay. Did they occur between 5,000 and 2300?

19 A. Correct. The second exchange occurred before the final approach fix.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. And we had a positive exchange.

22 Q. I know you've only -- so you've been into Chicago you said maybe a
23 dozen times. Was all of these changes that you had, was this unusual --

24 A. Extremely unusual.

25 Q. When you sitting reserve, where are you? Do you have a crash pad? Do

1 you stay at the airport?

2 A. Both.

3 Q. How about this time?

4 A. I believe at the crash pad.

5 Q. Okay. How far is that from the airport?

6 A. 30 minutes.

7 Q. Have you done a go around since flying the line?

8 A. No.

9 Q. What is Envoy's go around policy?

10 A. Well, if we have an unstable approach, if you do not see the runway, IMC
11 the main reason, wind shear.

12 Q. Do they have no fault go around policy?

13 A. They sure do.

14 Q. Are you required if you do a go around to go in and do paperwork or talk
15 to anybody?

16 A. No, ma'am.

17 Q. This airplane, you had flown to Norfolk the night before. Was this the
18 same aircraft that you were returning in or a different aircraft?

19 A. I am not 100 percent sure, ma'am. I want to say it was a different aircraft
20 because it was later flight of the day.

21 Q. Okay. Training, what type of training does Envoy provide in terms of
22 human factors?

23 A. Can you rephrase the question?

24 Q. Does Envoy provide training in terms of human factors?

25 A. And what is --

1 Q. Cognitive biases, visual illusion?

2 A. I don't recall.

3 Q. Okay. Was this your first time flying with this captain?

4 A. That was my second leg with that captain.

5 Q. But this was the first trip with him?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. And you were not an OE any more?

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. When did you end OE?

10 A. Sometime in August. I can look in my calendar and provide an exact date.

11 Q. That's okay. I want to ask about a 72 hour history, but I will wait until the
12 second round of questioning to do that. What did you think of the training you got at
13 Envoy?

14 A. Good training.

15 Q. Yeah. Was there anything when you got out that you wished you had
16 more of?

17 A. I didn't have a whole lot of landing definitely.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. You know, landing in the simulator and landing an aircraft, it's not the
20 same feeling.

21 Q. Um-hum. In what regards?

22 A. Well, you don't get -- you don't feel the ground effect the same way. You
23 don't feel it in your pants, you know.

24 Q. Okay. You mentioned that you had counted the runways. Were you
25 counting the runways based on the display in the cockpit? Were you looking out

1 visually? How were you doing that?

2 A. I was looking out visually because I was, I was focusing on maintaining
3 situational awareness on the runway. And I counted from the left.

4 Q. Now, that you've had some time to think about it, do you know what
5 pavement you mistook for being 10 left?

6 A. Yeah, Bravo 1 (ph.), taxiway.

7 Q. In your training, was there ever a scenario that you were given, maybe in
8 the simulator or something that was discussed where, you know, what to do if you start
9 getting all of these changes while you're on the approach and how to manage that?

10 A. Not during training. But we can always ask for delay vectors if we need to.

11 Q. You've been flying into Chicago in general. Is it a more challenging
12 approach?

13 A. Yeah, it is extremely challenging. The --

14 Q. What --

15 A. Well, the controller can be stern at the time, more demanding. The
16 approach speeds are faster. It's not usual that you'll fly the downwind at 11,000 feet,
17 300 knots and then they'll turn you quick and tell (ph.) you for the approach, and I
18 believe they're referred as being a slam dunk.

19 Q. I know you said it was a clear day, but was there anything either in the
20 cockpit or outside the cockpit, the sun, anything that, you know, hindered your view of
21 the runways?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Okay. And you said you don't wear glasses, right?

24 A. I do wear glasses at times, but I don't need them. It's my choice.

25 Q. Okay. Were you wearing them on this approach?

1 A. I was.

2 Q. Okay. Do you wear them for reading? Do you wear them for distance?

3 A. Mainly for reading.

4 Q. Okay. And glasses, not contacts.

5 A. Correct.

6 Q. Okay. I think that's all that I have for now. Thank you.

7 MS. BLUM: Okay. Tim.

8 MR. HUNTSMAN: Do you mind if we take a quick break? I'm going to talk
9 to him and then run to the restroom.

10 MS. BLUM: Okay. We'll stop the recording at 2:11 p.m.

11 (Off the record at 2:11 p.m.)

12 (On the record at 2:14 p.m.)

13 MS. BLUM: Okay. Back on at 2:14 p.m. And Tim.

14 BY MR. GRAHAM:

15 Q. Okay. So on the 24th, you were on rack, right, because they called you in
16 2 hours prior?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. Were you on rack 1 or 2?

19 A. I was on call. I can look on my schedule if it matters.

20 Q. Yeah, look at it real quick if you could and see. What type was that flight
21 supposed to depart and what time did you depart?

22 A. I was airport standby Tuesday.

23 Q. So you were called up at as airport standby.

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. Which one were you? You showed up at the airport at what time?

1 A. 3 o'clock.

2 Q. Airport standby at 3 o'clock.

3 A. So I misspoke earlier when I said was at that crash pad. That was my first
4 day of a 3 day set.

5 Q. So you were on reserve for the whole month of September?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Then you got on the block. Did you proffer?

8 A. I proffered for airport standby that day because I commuted.

9 Q. So you commuted in that day?

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. Where do you live?

12 A. I live in Tampa, Florida.

13 Q. Tampa. So what time did you get up?

14 A. On --

15 Q. Because you've gotta have two chances, right?

16 A. But I get -- I had taken standby because it was two flights prior. There was
17 one arriving at 1457 and there was one arriving at 1430. So I got the United flight at I
18 want to say it was 12 o'clock.

19 Q. So with the hour of time change coming East to Central, you got in at 2
20 o'clock?

21 A. 2:30.

22 Q. 2:30.

23 A. Something like that.

24 Q. How long after 3 o'clock did they call you?

25 A. I think it was around like 4 o'clock.

1 Q. So not right away.

2 A. No.

3 Q. About an hour and a half.

4 A. Not that I recall. I just got comfortable and I was bundled up with a
5 blanket, and I didn't expect to get called. So.

6 Q. So they called you at 4 o'clock. Obviously airport standby is, hey, you're
7 our last line of defense because they only have 2 hours to call somebody. So when
8 they called you at 4, when was that flight leaving Norfolk?

9 A. We left at 1754.

10 Q. And usually when you do that, when a captain, from my experience, was a
11 new guy, he said, I'm going to take it down, right? So he -- was the PF on the one to
12 Norfolk or were you?

13 A. On the way to Norfolk, I was flying.

14 Q. You were the PF on that one.

15 A. Correct. And halfway through that flight to Norfolk we got a condition in
16 the field, and we realized that the runway was short and was wet, and there was no
17 approach light and he asked me if I was comfortable, it was going to be a full flat
18 landing. So we agreed that it was better that he do the landing. So on our cruise flight
19 on the way to Norfolk the evening prior, we exchange role.

20 Q. And which -- what approach did you shoot in?

21 A. At Norfolk.

22 Q. You landed on 2-3 or 5, because that's the only runway that's long
23 enough.

24 A. I want to say we did runway 5. I don't recall 100 percent which one we
25 did. I think it was runway 5. And it was an RNAV that day because the ILS was out of

1 service.

2 Q. Because of that construction on that --

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. -- end of the runway. So you shoved RNAV in there with the magenta
5 needles, right?

6 A. I didn't shoot the approach. The captain did.

7 Q. You guys both did. To minimums or was it --

8 A. No, it was clear.

9 Q. So it was a visual backed up by the RNAV or was it an actual --

10 A. We did the RNAV to line up the runway and then I don't recall if we were
11 cleared visual because of the RNAV that evening, but it was clear.

12 Q. All right. So then you came back on the 25th and you were the PF the
13 whole time because you didn't get the change to shoot the approach the night before.
14 So you flew it back to Chicago.

15 A. We talked about it, and we -- the captain was like, well, why don't you fly
16 it. You didn't get to land. That's the fun part. So.

17 Q. Yeah. All right. So coming back on that next day on the STAR (ph.) into
18 Chicago, generally they can keep you around 10,000 to MONKZ (ph.) and then they'll
19 give you, you know, slow to 250 to send up 7,000 and they're just stepping you down,
20 right. But you said before, IZARD is when you found out you were going to 1-0 center?

21 A. Somewhere around there. I don't recall exactly but I was -- and the reason
22 why I say that, because I remember seeing the lake turning there. So it was like around
23 Lacey to IZARD or IZARD.

24 Q. All right. And since -- did you have time at that point for him to set up a
25 review for the visual backed up by the ILS? Is that what you guys -- you as the PF, is that

1 what you called for? Hey, we're going to do the visual at 1-0 center, let's back it up
2 with the ILS. Go ahead and --

3 A. The captain did the lead on that. He says I'll put it in, and I'll do the
4 briefing because I was ready to do the briefing, and I did not realize that we had like
5 very little time to get that set up. So he concluded since we're going to below 10,000 --
6 his word was not below 10,000. Like we're descending, I will do the set up and the
7 briefing. You focus on flying.

8 Q. At no time there, did you think let me just glance down at my FMS and
9 make sure everything is right and compare it to your --

10 A. No, that's correct, sir. I did not do that.

11 Q. So you turned 3-6-0, you know, once they take off sometimes, like you
12 said, they don't take you all the way out POSSM. They give you the heading, and then
13 they give you the vector to intercept, 0-6-0 intercept the final approach course, right?

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. And you turned to that heading and you armed the NAV.

16 A. No, I armed the NAV first and then I was about to make the turn and the
17 captain overruled me. He says we're going to do VL.

18 Q. So you're on 3-6-0, and they said turn right 0-6-0 intercept the course or
19 intercept the localizer is probably what they said, right?

20 A. I may have started doing the turn first and then hit NAV.

21 Q. But then he wanted to use the VL?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. Had preview been said, preview is available like we --

24 A. I don't recall seeing it but when I pressed preview, I remember like the
25 blue needle giving me something that did not correlate to what we were doing.

1 Q. So that was your first thought, that this doesn't look right?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. Did you happen to say that? This doesn't look right.

4 A. We were like it's something off here. And the other time, too, when we
5 went to VL, we didn't have the glide scope because that was the second indication that
6 something was not right.

7 Q. So you've got two things that aren't looking right. Did you ever think, let's
8 just shoot it in FMS?

9 A. Well, the captain said he wanted to do VL, and I wasn't going to argue
10 with the captain at that point.

11 Q. All right. When you exchanged the controls and you went to PM and he
12 went to the PF, did you take that chance to re-look at your own FMS to find out what's
13 going on there?

14 A. Well, I look at the frequencies, and the frequencies were correct. We're
15 always taught that when some things start not adding up, downgrade the level of
16 automations. So at that point, I had RAYYY in front of me on the MFD, see the
17 frequencies were correct, and I had a clear visual on the runway.

18 Q. When you switched the controls back to you being the PF and you said
19 the captain was heads again, do you know what he was doing?

20 A. Double checking the FMS frequencies. I mean I was maintaining my scan
21 of the runway and flying the airplane at that time.

22 Q. You went back to Norfolk that evening with a different captain though?

23 A. Correct.

24 Q. Did you PM or PF that one?

25 A. The captain flew to Norfolk and I flew back to --

1 Q. On the 26th you flew back?

2 A. You know, captain, I don't recall if I flew. I didn't fly to Norfolk. The
3 captain flew to Norfolk, correct, because I remember the runway had been shortened.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. And it was going to be a flat final and I had not done a flat final on a short
6 runway. So I think we had a conversation.

7 Q. All right. So then on the 26th when you came back and did your fourth
8 leg (ph.), was it another visual back into Chicago?

9 A. It was a visual backup with the ILS on 10 right.

10 Q. 10 right.

11 A. I did fly because I flew the ILS 10 right was Yankee, and I remember the
12 captain coaching me on the Yankee ILS there, too. Keep it down.

13 Q. Because it's offset.

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. Those are reading glasses that you wear. Is it on your medical?

16 A. No. By choice, I started to like them. I brought in my last medical, but
17 didn't have to use them.

18 MR. GRAHAM: I don't have any other questions.

19 MS. BLUM: Okay. Thanks, Tim. Gerard.

20 BY MR. SMITHERS:

21 Q. Sure. No pressure. I've got a couple of questions. One, regarding the
22 human factors, you don't by any chance remember going through ground school, the
23 human factors, circadian rhythm, hypoxia, it would have been on day 2, or is there so
24 much coming at you, we won't worry about that?

25 A. I am sure it's part of the program. I don't recall.

1 Q. Yeah. Okay. One question was brought up, when you were coming in for
2 the approach, I want to make sure I've got this right, you said you selected -- NAV was
3 selected, and then once NAV was selected, the captain then selected VL. Is that
4 correct?

5 A. Yes.

6 MR. SMITHERS: Wouldn't that put him in a roll mode at that point and
7 you would have got a ding?

8 MR. GRAHAM: Yeah, until you intercepted that.

9 BY MR. SMITHERS:

10 Q. Right. So --

11 A. And I may have gotten the roll and re-headed.

12 Q. So you got the roll and then you selected heading off of that?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. I did not recall that, but that sounds right.

16 Q. Okay. And, when you were lined up for 10 left, you honestly thought that
17 that was 10 center, that was the runway you were landing and you felt pretty confident,
18 correct?

19 A. I doubted until I was cleared to land on the final approach fix, and that
20 removed my doubt. I mean 10 center is PRM and -- is a PRM runway. If I didn't line up.

21 Q. Excellent.

22 MR. GRAHAM: Well, it's a PRM used runway but unless they're actually
23 shooting PRMs, there wouldn't be a monitor frequency that you'd tune up. You
24 wouldn't brake for PRM --

25 FO BEAUMONT: Correct. My point is just that the tower had a capacity

1 to very well see my position on the runway line up.

2 BY MR. SMITHERS:

3 Q. And as you said, you were cleared to land 10 center. You were lined up
4 for 10 left.

5 A. (Indiscernible) --

6 Q. You had not lined up with nothing else until you touched the ground,
7 correct?

8 A. I had been lined up with the same runway for miles and miles and miles.
9 So I didn't doubt that I was lined up on the wrong one at that point.

10 Q. And certainly coming in to land, you had a nice landing distance in there
11 and 10 left might have been obscured by your landing profile that you thought was the
12 runway or something like that?

13 A. Of course, when I'm looking down, I never saw the numbers on it.

14 Q. Excellent.

15 MR. SMITHERS: That's all the questions I had. You guys really are
16 (indiscernible). It's good being the third (ph.) person. Thank you.

17 BY MS. BLUM:

18 Q. So, what were the opportunities do you feel like could have mitigated
19 this? What pieces of information were available to you to confirm you were on the right
20 runway?

21 A. Are you asking me what I should have done to confirm?

22 Q. Yeah.

23 A. In hindsight, we should have communicated with ATC and I would say
24 that was a mistake that we made, but I will honor -- pay the price for it but, yes, we
25 should have contacted ATC to say that we were having issues with our localizer or

1 we're not getting a signal. There's not auto-tune identifying. It probably should have
2 been done. Or, to rephrase that, it had to be done.

3 Q. Anything else like the numbers as you get closer?

4 A. I was flying the plane focusing on my touch down zone, being on time, no.

5 Q. Okay. Let's see. So these guys probably understand. I don't. So when
6 you're talking about getting your NAV and the captain tells you to go to VL, you got a
7 roll and a ding in roll mode and you went to heading mode. Do you normally intercept
8 the course in NAV on these visuals backed up with the ILS or do you intercept them on
9 approach? I'm trying to understand when you go to VL? Why the captain told you to
10 do that? Was that confusing for you?

11 A. It could work on VL. I had been schooled by another captain before to
12 always use the FMS mode as it makes a nicer, a smoother turn.

13 Q. Uh-huh. So when the captain asked you to go to VL mode, had he already
14 noticed something was wrong with the FMS do you know?

15 A. I talked that I was not getting the right course, and that we were not
16 getting the glide slope. Was that before or after, I can't recall.

17 Q. Okay.

18 MS. BLUM: I think some of these questions Kat will go over. Yeah, I think
19 that's going to be my questions. Kat.

20 DR. WILSON: Thanks.

21 BY DR. WILSON:

22 Q. I don't have too many. How would you say your pairing was with this
23 captain? Did you all get along?

24 A. Yeah, actually we -- our crew resource management might be my favorite
25 thing about this gentleman.

1 Q. Okay. What did you think was the best part of the CRM with this captain?

2 A. Well, on the way in the night before, I told him, hey, if you have any
3 feedback please feel free to mention it. I take it all. Like I'm new. I have nothing to
4 prove. This is my second career, and I'm, you know, I'm easy to get along with.

5 Q. Was the captain someone you felt comfortable if you, you know, speaking
6 if you didn't think he was doing the right thing? You mentioned at one point, you
7 know, he was the captain. So you weren't going to question him.

8 A. I did, I did feel comfortable to speaking up, but at that point on the
9 approach, we had a higher level of -- what's the word I'm looking for -- task was held
10 higher. I don't want to say saturation but, you know, I didn't think it was the proper
11 time to question him on what we were doing. I mean if we would have been
12 questioning something on the approach before at a lower level, I would have been
13 comfort, but I've never been to battle, but when intensity increases, it's not the time to
14 question the authority.

15 Q. I want to go back to some of history, and I think we got into this a little bit
16 when you talked about your schedule and where you were sitting while you were on
17 reserve, but I want to go back to Sunday, the 22nd of September. If you have a
18 calendar, you're welcome to pull it up. What time do you think you woke up on that
19 day?

20 A. The 22nd?

21 Q. Um-hum.

22 A. You're asking me what I did on a Sunday, over 3 weeks ago. Q. And if
23 you don't recall, you don't recall but --

24 A. I don't recall. It was probably a Sunday morning with the family. I'm sure
25 we went and got coffee, took the duck to the duck park, but to tell you what we did that

1 day, no, I do not.

2 Q. So you were not working.

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. Typically on a Sunday, do you sleep in?

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. Yeah. Okay.

7 A. As much as --

8 Q. Do you set an alarm to wake up?

9 A. No. I have a 5 year old.

10 Q. That's an alarm. I'm happy to report my 13 year old now does not do that.

11 Okay. All right. Say day off, you're not sure when you woke up. How about, do you
12 recall when you went to bed that night?

13 A. It was a school day. 9 o'clock, 9:30.

14 Q. When you get into bed, do you watch TV or read?

15 A. It depends, ma'am.

16 Q. Um-hum.

17 A. I sometimes --

18 Q. You don't recall.

19 A. I don't recall that day.

20 Q. And do you typically have any problems falling asleep or staying asleep at
21 night?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Okay. All right. So, Monday, the 23rd, do you recall what time you woke
24 up?

25 A. I know where you're going with this. Probably early. I drive my daughter

1 to school.

2 Q. What would be early?

3 A. 6:30.

4 Q. And do you set an alarm when you have to wake up to take your daughter
5 to school?

6 A. I don't but we do. (Indiscernible).

7 Q. Were you working on Monday?

8 A. No, ma'am, I was off on Monday.

9 Q. And routine activities that day?

10 A. A daily nap, kids running around, house cleaning.

11 Q. Napping. That's great. What time -- do you recall what time you took nap
12 or how long you took a nap for?

13 A. Usually after lunch, you know, for like half an hour or 45 minutes.

14 Q. And on Monday, do you recall what time you went to bed?

15 A. Probably pretty early. I think around like 9.

16 Q. And problems falling to sleep or staying asleep that you recall?

17 A. No, ma'am.

18 Q. Do you recall if you read before going to bed?

19 A. No, ma'am, I do not. I probably read the reserve list for the next day and
20 where I stand and what the open times were and started getting ready to go to work.

21 Q. All right. Tuesday, the 24th. Do you recall what time you woke up?

22 A. Probably around like the same time the day before, drove my daughter to
23 school, came back.

24 Q. Did you take a nap?

25 A. I don't recall if I take a nap in the morning there, but I didn't have to leave

1 until 11. I was already packed up from the day before. So, I'm not sure if I took a nap. I
2 don't know. But I usually would do -- take a nap. I started that habit at the same time
3 when I sim late. I usually took a nap in the afternoon before going.

4 Q. And the 11 o'clock flight, that was the United flight you said you took.

5 A. It was a noon, yeah.

6 Q. Okay. So you left your house at 11. Walk me through what that day was
7 like?

8 A. 10:30, something like that, left for the airport.

9 Q. And then you took -- you road in the jump seat, you had a seat in the
10 cabin.

11 A. I had a seat in the cabin.

12 Q. And then --

13 A. You know, ma'am, don't quote me on this. I don't remember if I was
14 sitting in the cabin or not now. But I usually prefer -- like to commute on United. They
15 do everything to make you feel comfortable.

16 Q. Great. And then I think you said you were there just a couple of hours
17 before you got called?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. Okay. And then you took this flight to Norfolk?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. And do you recall what to bed on the 24th?

22 A. Probably around 11.

23 Q. Any problems that you recall falling asleep or staying asleep?

24 A. No, ma'am.

25 Q. Do you recall if you read or did anything before when you got into bed?

1 A. I remember I caught the night of that night, the highlights and then I went
2 to bed.

3 Q. And then Wednesday, the day of the event, what time did you wake up?

4 A. I don't recall, ma'am, but I slept in. I didn't have an alarm. I never put an
5 alarm. So, I don't do it at home. My wife usually does that. So when I'm on the road, I
6 don't have to wake up, I don't wake up to an alarm.

7 Q. So did you say you were awake by 11? I'm sorry. Did I just hear that in my
8 head?

9 A. That day, what I do remember is that I went -- as far as timeline goes, I
10 took a good hour and a half, 2 hour walk around town, it might have been 2 1/2 hours,
11 and then I ran into Captain Bachand around 11:15, and we agreed to meet up for
12 lunch. And so I probably slept in until like 9 o'clock I'd say.

13 Q. Okay. Do you eat breakfast?

14 A. I sometimes do, sometimes don't.

15 Q. Did you eat breakfast that day?

16 A. No, I had not because it was -- I only remember eating -- oh, no, that's not
17 true. The crew room that they have at that hotel, they do have like a little package of
18 like scrambled eggs with some potatoes. So I a little bit of scrambled eggs before I
19 went on a walk.

20 Q. And did you get a chance to take a nap that day?

21 A. No, I had not taken a nap. I mean I had like a full night's rest, you know.
22 There was no stress. You know, I felt energized. I had just gone for a walk/run. I know,
23 no, I am not taking a nap.

24 Q. Okay. And on the approach into Chicago, how did you feel?

25 A. I felt great.

1 Q. Rested?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. Great. And if you were to rate your health on a scale of 1 to 10?

4 A. Well, I surely can lose a little weight there but, you know, I'm healthy.

5 Besides my weight, I'm healthy. I'll scale it as a 9.

6 Q. Okay. Any recent illnesses or injuries?

7 A. No, ma'am.

8 Q. All right. Any recent changes to your personal life? I know you said
9 you're married. But any death of a close friend, colleague, family member?

10 A. No, ma'am.

11 Q. All right. Any changes in your financial situation either good or bad?

12 A. No, ma'am. As routinely as it is.

13 Q. Have you ever spoken to a doctor about or been diagnosed with a sleep
14 disorder?

15 A. No, ma'am.

16 Q. I think that's all that I have. Thank you, sir.

17 MS. BLUM: Do you have any further questions, Tim?

18 BY MR. GRAHAM:

19 Q. This is a long shot, but do you happen to remember what your landing
20 fuel amount was?

21 A. If I make an educated guess, because I don't recall, I would say like
22 around like 67, 68.

23 Q. Okay. Sometimes if it's low, people are hesitant to do a go around
24 because, you know.

25 A. No, that was not part of it, no.

1 Q. All right. You said this is your second career. What did you do on your
2 first career?

3 A. I ran luxury counter for Hilton in South Florida.

4 Q. The hotel business. Is that is?

5 A. Correct.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. It comes to the weight thing, you know.

8 MR. GRAHAM: That's it.

9 MR. SMITHERS: Well, I'm sorry to say, when you were bringing up the
10 health issue and you said your weight Matt and I looked down.

11 MR. GRAHAM: You got me, huh.

12 MR. SMITHERS: Yeah, me, too. I have no questions. Thank you.

13 BY MS. BLUM:

14 Q. Okay. I'll start to wrap it up. So is there anything that we haven't asked
15 you that you wish we would have?

16 A. Nothing comes to mind.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. I mean why didn't you go around? I didn't feel like I needed to. We had --
19 I could see there was no conflict from any other aircraft. It was clear in a million. It was
20 a stabilized approach.

21 Q. It was stabilized.

22 A. We were cleared for land. I didn't see --

23 Q. Any reason to go.

24 A. -- any safety issue.

25 MR. GRAHAM: One follow up.

1 MS. BLUM: Sure, Tim. Go ahead.

2 BY MR. GRAHAM:

3 Q. You mentioned that aircraft that you saw crossing. Do you realize now
4 what that was?

5 A. Yes, I do.

6 Q. What was it?

7 A. It was the traffic coming on 10 center that was taxiing off of 10 left.

8 Q. Crosses there --

9 A. Yes, I do now.

10 Q. Sierra, Sierra.

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. Sorry.

13 MS. BLUM: So to clarify, he had landed on 10 center and he was crossing
14 10 left?

15 FO BEAUMONT: Yes, I do realize that now. I did not then.

16 MR. GRAHAM: Yeah, the exit, back taxi on Papa, cross at Sierra, Sierra.
17 That's the traffic that you saw crossing that runway.

18 BY MS. BLUM:

19 Q. So looking back, are there any safety related suggestions you'd like to
20 make?

21 A. I can't think of anything at this moment.

22 Q. Okay.

23 With that, we will end the interview at 2:45 p.m.

24 (Whereupon, at 2:45 p.m. CST, the interview was concluded.)

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceeding before the

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF: WRONG RUNWAY LANDING AT THE
CHICAGO O'HARE INTERNATIONAL
AIRPORT IN CHICAGO, ILLINOIS
ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2024
Interview of Alexandre J. Beaumont

ACCIDENT NO.: DCA24LA318

PLACE: via Microsoft Teams

DATE: October 8, 2024

was held according to the record, and that this is the original, complete, true
and accurate transcript which has been transcribed to the best of my skill and ability.


Transcriber

FIRST OFFICERS WRITTEN STATEMENT

Alexandre Beaumont Statement on flight 3936 ORF-ORD on September 25, 2024

On the ground at KORF during departure briefing, I stated we would expect ILS RWY 27R based upon current conditions at KORD. After leveling off, ATIS in KORD was advertising RWY 9L. During my approach briefing I covered ILS runway 9L. About an hour later, we received a new ATIS for ORD indicating we should expect runway 9C. I proceeded to brief 9C. Before our arrival descent, ATC switched us from the Watsn4 arrival to the Esspo5 arrival. We briefed the new arrival and cross-checked all way points. The Captain and I discussed which runway we should expect and concluded we would most likely get runway 10R based on the ATIS and new arrival. I proceeded to brief runway 10R and cross-check all way points and frequencies. As we were about to turn downwind, while being assigned a new altitude, approach told us to expect runway 10C. The Captain changed the FMS and did the briefing; I was focused on flying while descending below 10000 ft. While in the downwind, we could clearly see the airport. We were cleared down to 5000 ft. After the Captain completed the briefing, I asked him to put a 1 nm circle around the FAF RAYYY. Visibility was great. There was no other plane in the queue. A few miles from POSMM, we were given a 360 heading. The Captain sequenced the approach from SHARN on the FMS. As we turned to the required heading, I engaged preview. Preview did not come on as expected; preview gave us an incorrect course of 330 or 360, I can't recall exactly. We were assigned a new heading of 060 to join the localizer. I elected to activate the nav mode for the intercept; Captain overruled me and elected to press the v/I mode instead. Before I started the turn to 060, I adjusted the Localizer cursor to 093 degree for the intercept. The green needle was pegged to the left, putting us right of course. APP mode did not engage. We had no glide slope and the needle was not moving. According to the Localizer, we were right of course, which did not make sense. I could see our position on the MFD, so I manually turned the airplane toward the track displayed on the MFD. Subsequently, ATC cleared us for the visual RWY 10C and told us to contact tower at RAYYY. On heading mode, I pointed the plane toward the FAF that we had identified with a 1 nm circle on the MFD. I could see the field very well. I used the FPA mode to start our descent toward the FAF displayed on the MFD. The Captain was double checking frequencies while I was maintaining situational awareness in and out of the cockpit and maintaining a visual on the intended runway. I was not sure what was happening with the ILS frequencies. The Captain made a statement that we needed to come down quicker; he pressed the FLCH and assumed control of the aircraft hand flying. While the Captain started to fly, I checked the ILS frequencies. I could not see anything wrong. As I came back

heads up, maintaining a visual with the field and intended runway, the Captain gave me back the control of the aircraft. I looked for visual clues to confirm we were aligned with the correct runway, as I was hand flying. The South side of the field was empty with no conflicting aircraft – no planes taxiing, no planes departing, and no other plane had just landed to help us differentiate the proper runway. The Captain contacted tower a little bit past RAYYY. Tower cleared us to land on 10C, removing my doubt that we were aligned on the wrong runway. As we landed, we realized we were on 10L and not 10C as we were cleared.

We safely taxied off as directed by ATC. We paused to double check all FMS settings and frequencies. We did not find any reason why the localizer or the glideslope did not auto tune. From there we followed taxi instruction to the gate.

Alexandre Beaumont
October 7, 2024