

Fox Todd

From: Fox Todd
Sent: Monday, August 25, 2014 7:33 AM
To: 'Thomas.G.Kozura' [REDACTED]
Cc: Fox Todd
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Inspector Kozura,

Thank you for the clarification on the weight-and-balance of the airplane before departure. From your calculations, the airplane was likely near or at maximum gross weight during the accident takeoff.

I will include this correspondence with my supporting documentation associated with NTSB Accident No. CEN14LA406.

Thank you again for your continued support of this on-going investigation.

Sincerely,
Andrew Todd Fox
NTSB, Air Safety Investigator

From: Thomas.G.Kozura [REDACTED]
Sent: Friday, August 22, 2014 10:20 AM
To: Fox Todd
Cc:
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement

Todd,

Attached is the analysis of the logs of N468LE, CE-177. We have determined that the increase in empty weight was 19.3 pounds for the modifications with negligible weight and balance entries. An additional 20 pounds in camera equipment was installed which I included in my baggage estimate. With these increases it seems that the aircraft was probably near or at max gross weight but it is not possible to determine if it was over as we do not conclusively know the amount of fuel on board.

Sincerely,
Tom

Thomas G. Kozura
Principal Operations Inspector
Grand Rapids, FSDO
[REDACTED]

From: Fox Todd
Sent: Thursday, August 21, 2014 3:07 PM
To: Thomas.G.Kozura [REDACTED]
Cc: Fox Todd
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement

Tom,

I did not ask the flight instructor to breakdown his numbers, since I knew you were going to providing me an inspector statement about the same issue. I figured that his value (2,752.3 lbs) was what you all had discussed in the days following the accident.

I look forward to the additional information that the maintenance inspector will be provide tomorrow.

Sincerely,
Todd

From: Thomas.G.Kozura [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, August 21, 2014 2:07 PM
To: Fox Todd
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement

Hello Todd,

I see you have the pilot statement that the takeoff weight was 2,752.3. Do you know how he broke that down? Did he use 60 pounds for baggage? His calculations that were found in the aircraft show he used 25 pounds for baggage and had a takeoff weight of 2,712.3. Seems he has been recalculating.

Sincerely,

Tom

Thomas G. Kozura
Principal Operations Inspector
Grand Rapids, FSDO
[REDACTED]

From: Fox Todd [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, August 21, 2014 1:55 PM
To: Kozura, Thomas G (FAA)
Cc: Fox Todd
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement

Inspector Kozura,

Thank you for the clarification... so, with the weight-and-balance data available to the flight crew, they were still under the maximum gross weight of 2,800 lbs.

The flight instructor, on his NTSB accident report, listed the weight of the airplane at departure was 2,752.3 lbs. So, if we add the additional 35 lbs to his calculation, the airplane still was below 2,800 lbs.

However, during your postaccident research, you discovered there had been numerous aircraft alterations, modifications, or repairs that could have resulted in additional (undocumented) weight. By themselves, these changes were deemed to have an insignificant change to the airplane's weight-and-balance; however, your

investigation has shown that there could have been as much as 100 lbs of undocumented weight added to the airplane when you add all of these changes together.

Please advise if I have characterized all of this correctly.

Sincerely,
Andrew Todd Fox
NTSB, Air Safety Investigator

From: [Thomas.G.Kozura](#) [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, August 21, 2014 9:48 AM
To: Fox Todd
Subject: FW: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement
Importance: High

Hello Todd,

Here is a clarification for you on the wreckage examination. Please let me know if this is sufficient detail.

On-site wreckage examination of N468LE revealed that the flaps and the flap handle were both set to 20°, the flap indicator showed 10°. The flap indicator appeared to be jammed due to structural damage incurred during the accident. The fuel lines were broken and the fuel tanks were drained but both the pilot and the instructor pilot state that they had 25 gallons of fuel on board for the departure from Manistee Blacker Airport (MBL). The aircraft contained approximately 60 pounds of baggage including installed camera equipment and power supply. This is 35 pounds more than the instructor pilot calculated placing the aircraft at approximately 2747 pounds with a maximum gross weight of 2800 pounds.

Sincerely,
Tom

Thomas G. Kozura
Principal Operations Inspector
Grand Rapids, FSDO
[REDACTED]

From: Fox Todd [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, August 21, 2014 9:19 AM
To: Kozura, Thomas G (FAA)
Cc: Fox Todd
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement
Importance: High

Inspector Kozura,

Could you provide some additional information concerning my couple of questions listed below?

Please advise when able.

Sincerely,
Andrew Todd Fox
NTSB, Air Safety Investigator

From: Fox Todd
Sent: Tuesday, August 19, 2014 3:25 PM
To: [Thomas.G.Kozura](#) [REDACTED]
Cc: Fox Todd
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement
Importance: High

Inspector Kozura,

Can you please clarify the weight-and-balance of the airplane before the accident takeoff?

Also, please confirm that the flap indicator (showing 10 degrees, with 20 degrees of flap selected) was erroneous because of damage sustained during the accident. For example, as you moved the flaps up-and-down during your postaccident examination... did the indicator also move?

Please advise when able.

Sincerely,
Andrew Todd Fox
NTSB, Air Safety Investigator

From: [Thomas.G.Kozura](#) [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday, August 19, 2014 2:44 PM
To: Fox Todd
Subject: RE: CEN14LA406 - FAA Inspector Statement

On August 05, 2014, approximately 15:10 eastern daylight time, a Cessna CE-177 Cardinal aircraft, N468LE, impacted terrain after departing Runway 18 at Manistee Blacker Airport (KMBL) Manistee, Michigan. The certified flight instructor pilot and his student received minor injuries. The two rear seat passengers received minor injuries and were transported to the hospital for evaluation. The aircraft was registered to a private individual and was destroyed. The accident instructor pilot was operating the aircraft under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 91 as an instructional flight. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the accident location. The flight originated without a flight plan from Manistee Blacker Airport (KMBL) Manistee, Michigan about 15:10 eastern daylight time and was destined for Charlotte Beach Airport (FPK) Charlotte, Michigan.

The weather observation station at Manistee Blacker Airport (KMBL) Manistee, Michigan was inoperative at the time of the accident. The weather observation at the Mason County airport, Ludington Michigan, located about 20 miles south of the accident site, reported the following conditions at 14:55 eastern daylight time: wind 300 degrees at 09 knots, 15 visibility 10 statute miles, scattered clouds at 4,000 feet AGL, scattered clouds at 4,500 feet AGL, broken clouds at 6,000 feet AGL temperature 24 degrees Celsius (C), dew point 16 degrees C, altimeter setting 30.07.

The instructor pilot stated that he was completing a complex check out for the private pilot in the left seat. The AWOS was inoperative at the airport during the time of the accident and the instructor pilot stated that he referred to the wind sock that was on the North West corner of the field. According to both pilots the winds appeared to be light and variable so they elected to do a short field takeoff from runway 18. The runway length was 2721 feet and the Pilots Operating Handbook (POH) showed that the aircraft, at maximum gross weight, should clear a 50 foot obstacle in approximately 1850 feet, assuming no wind and a hard surface, dry runway. The private pilot in the left seat and the instructor pilot in the right seat performed the before takeoff checklist using the challenge and response method. The instructor pilot stated that he called for flaps 20° and the private pilot set them to 20°. The instructor pilot stated that he realized his mistake in calling for flaps 20° and then called for flaps 10° but failed to confirm the change had been

accomplished. He stated this several times during the initial interview but recants this in his written statement and said he noticed this and changed the flap setting. The takeoff was initiated and the private pilot called rotate at 66 knots as he lifted off with 1000 feet remaining. At approximately 10 feet the aircraft settled back to the runway. The takeoff was continued and the instructor pilot never took control of the aircraft as they departed the runway and continued through 300 feet of grass and off a 50 foot hill launching the aircraft over the 10 foot airport perimeter fence.

On-site wreckage examination revealed that the flaps and the flap handle were both set to 20°, the indicator showed 10°. The aircraft contained approximately 60 pounds of baggage including installed camera equipment and power supply.

Thomas G. Kozura
Principal Operations Inspector
Grand Rapids, FSDO
[REDACTED]