

To Whom it may concern,

This is a follow up and revision to my initial written account of the accident that took place at Kapalua (West Maui) Airport on the 18th of August, 2019. I am writing this because my initial report was written the day of the accident. When writing my initial report to Mokulele, I was still a bit in shock from the events of that day. My initial report was vague and left a lot to be said. The purpose of this report is to add extra insight into the accident and hopefully clear some things up so that we can get to the bottom of what went wrong with the aircraft that day.

It was a beautiful VFR day that morning. There was barely a cloud in the sky. My captain Richard Morgan flew the first leg of the day from OGG to HNL and everything seemed fine throughout the flight. We landed in Honolulu and still everything seemed to be operating normally.

The second leg of the day was flight 504 from HNL to JHM and it was my leg and we were flying N879MA. I had flown this route plenty of times and felt extremely comfortable with the trip to Kapalua especially given the weather that day. We received our clearance for the freeway two departure and a taxi clearance to runway 8L at Echo in HNL. While taxiing Tim Sprowls, another pilot for Mokulele was in row 5. His initial account stated that he both heard and saw Beta functioning properly on taxi. I can't account for what he witnessed and/or heard, but I do know that I have sat in row 5 and it is extremely difficult to see and/or hear anything going on in the cockpit. I will say that I didn't experience anything abnormal on taxi. The only thing I will say is that sometimes our Caravans are rigged with extremely weak Beta and we have to use a combo of brakes and beta when taxiing. So I'm not sure I would have noticed a problem even if there was one.

We departed from HNL and began our trip to JHM. Throughout the enroute phase of the flight we experienced no abnormalities other than a failed standby attitude indicator. It was tumbling slowly and we didn't think much of it because we both had seen this happen before in the Caravan and it usually fixes itself. We took the north shore of Molokai to get to JHM, a standard route for Mokulele. Once we came around the cape of Halawa we got on with Kapalua Unicom. They gave us the winds and told us to report over the shoreline for the shoreline arrival. The winds at the time were 040 at 11 gusting 19. Because of the gusts I briefed the approach to my captain as approach flaps instead of full flaps and 95 over the numbers. We crossed the shoreline at 1500' and were fully configured. As we turned towards runway 2 for final approach the last airspeed I remember seeing was 105 KIAS which for Kapalua is exactly where you want to be because typically when you throw the Caravans into flight idle they will dissipate airspeed fairly rapidly. Kapalua is also a very unique airport. There is a constant shear line right about midfield on the runway. So you will almost always have a tailwind on final that switches to a headwind somewhere on the runway. There is also a gulch just before the approach end of runway 02 and it will almost always balloon you up and you can bleed off airspeed fairly substantially. You don't want to come in too slow over the gulch

because you'll end up close to stall speed and have to add power. On short final we were stabilized and the approach looked perfectly routine. However I do remember pulling back on the throttle to make sure it was at the idle gate because it felt like we weren't slowing down like we should be. Once we got into ground effect it still felt like we weren't slowing down. Still... at this point there was no real cause for concern because some of the Caravans we fly tend to hold speed more so than others. As we floated past Alpha, my captain said "were good, just put it down and put it into reverse" so I said yes sir. I landed the plane before Bravo and immediately went into Beta and then reverse. When I put the power lever past the gate we never got any response at all through beta and even into reverse. So much so that Richard said to me "hey man, REVERSE!" I responded, "I AM". At that point I moved the lever to full reverse. Still got nothing and in fact we were somehow still producing forward thrust! Again, so much so that Richard looked at me and said "FULL REVERSE", to which I said "I AM". At this point Richard put his hand on top of mine on the throttle to make sure I was and indeed I was at MAX REVERSE. At that point we both realized something was severely wrong. I was already on the brakes as hard as I could be, but the SICs brakes are purposely rigged to be weak to prevent newer pilots from popping tires. So I called for help on the brakes from the captain's side. Richard replied "I already am!". We were still producing so much forward momentum that the brakes were ineffective. It was almost like we were a pebble skipping across a lake. At this point both of us realized that a go around was not only ill advised, but also no longer an option. With a questionable FCU, and/or prop system it would have been the worst thing we could have done to try and take back off. At that point Richard took control of the rudder pedals and we tried a sweeping turn to stop us in the grass at the end of the runway, and still couldn't get hardly any slowing... Even with full reverse, max braking, and an 11 knot headwind. Again not sure how that is possible because if we truly were in full reverse, not only should we have been slowing down well before that, but we should have had dirt and debris flying ahead of the airplane, which we did not. After a sweeping 90-degree turn and still hardly any slowing, we ended up through the airport boundary fence and down a slight embankment in a bed of tree saplings. Miraculously all 10 souls on board not a single person was injured.

In conclusion... My Captain and I FIRMLY stand by our initial belief that the aircraft had a critical mechanical malfunction that day at Kapalua. Given the circumstances of the landing, along with having an unreliable aircraft, my captain and I both feel strongly that we did the best we could with the situation we were given in order to prevent serious injury!